

# REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES – ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

# 11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

### **PRINCIPAL AUSTRALIAN HISTORIC THEME(S)**

- 3.19 Marketing and retailing
- 4.1.5 Developing city centres

### HERITAGE COUNCIL OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA THEME(S)

308 Commercial services and activities

# 11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE\*

The remaining fabric of the front façade above ground floor colonnade level and the roofscape of *Cremorne Arcade* is a good example of two classically derived frontages abutting one another, and by means of a closely aligned architectural style and language, achieving fine compositional harmony. (Criterion 1.1)

Notwithstanding the loss of the shop fronts and the formation of the colonnade along the street frontage, the first floor level of *Cremorne Arcade* makes a positive contribution to the streetscape setting. (Criterion 1.4)

# 11. 2. HISTORIC VALUE

*Cremorne Arcade* illustrates the type of two-storey commercial building constructed in the early twentieth century to provide shops at the ground floor and offices at the first floor, and the adaptations made to such premises over time. (Criterion 2.1)

*Cremorne Arcade* provides evidence of the urban expansion and the intensive building program that occurred in the City of Perth as a result of the State's gold boom from the 1890s up to World War One, being substantial commercial premises of this era. (Criterion 2.2)

For over twenty years from 1901, *Cremorne Arcade* was used as a business premises by Charles Harper, who was a Victoria Park Councillor from 1905 and served as Lord Mayor for Perth from 1937 to 1939. (Criterion 2.3)

For consistency, all references to architectural style are taken from Apperly, R., Irving, R., Reynolds, P. A *Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture. Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present,* Angus and Roberston, North Ryde, 1989.

For consistency, all references to garden and landscape types and styles are taken from Ramsay, J. *Parks, Gardens and Special Trees: A Classification and Assessment Method for the Register of the National Estate,* Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra, 1991, with additional reference to Richards, O. *Theoretical Framework for Designed Landscapes in WA*, unpublished report, 1997.

#### 11. 3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

-----

## 11.4. SOCIAL VALUE

*Cremorne Arcade* contributes to the Perth community's sense of place as an historic building in the central city, as evidenced by its inclusion in the City of Perth's Municipal Inventory and Town Planning Scheme. (Criterion 4.2)

## 12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

### 12. 1. RARITY

\_\_\_\_\_

### 12.2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

*Cremorne Arcade* is a representative example of the façade of a commercial building of the gold boom period constructed in the Federation Free Classical style. (Criterion 6.1)

### 12.3 CONDITION

*Cremorne Arcade* has undergone many changes throughout its history, partly to accommodate changing needs and uses and partly for maintenance purposes. Cumulative maintenance and significant change related to usage have detracted from the place and its presentation, particularly internally and at ground floor level. Only a small part of the place is occupied and little maintenance has been undertaken since the major tenants vacated. While the place is structurally sound the interiors are in fair to poor condition. Overall the place is in fair to good condition.

#### 12.4 INTEGRITY

The original concept was an open laneway with narrow buildings facing on to the lane, and this later became a formalised notion, with the lane becoming an arcade. From the mid 1980s the buildings underwent significant change and effectively forged the separate components into a single entity, rather than two buildings linked by an arcade. The original intent has been almost entirely obscured. The place has a low degree of integrity.

## 12.5 AUTHENTICITY

The upper facades to the two buildings that comprise *Cremorne Arcade* have been painted and the verandahs removed from both buildings, but the upper levels retain a high level of original fabric. The lane and later arcade have been lost with the integration of the two buildings into a single entity, and the majority of the fabric within the flanking east and west walls is replacement material. The whole of the internal fit out is post 1980 material. Overall, apart from the upper façade, the place retains a low degree of authenticity.

# 13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The documentation for this place is based on the heritage assessment by Clare Schulz, Historian and Philip Griffiths, Architect, in September 2004, with amendments and/or additions by HCWA staff and the Register Committee.

## 13.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

*Cremorne Arcade* is a two-storey brick, stucco, and iron building in the Federation Free Classical style, with a basement, shops at the ground floor and commercial spaces at the first floor, built for Annie Oliver. Early sections of the place were constructed in 1896/97, with major development, including the façade, completed in 1901. Further major additions were made in 1913 and 1930. In 1987, the place underwent significant redevelopment for its conversion to a McDonalds restaurant and no longer resembles either the original lane or the early arcade.

Surveyor-General John Septimus Roe's initial plans for central Perth, following its founding in August 1829, established a grid pattern with major east-west spines. A central area, bounded by St George's Terrace, Barrack Street, Wellington Street and Pier Street, was set aside as Government Reserve Lot Q. Roads that had an alignment across the reserve had different names either side of it: what is now Hay Street for the length of the city was once Howick Street to the east of the reserve, and the eastern end of present-day Murray Street was Goderich Street. Hay/Howick Street, although it ran along the crest of the hill, was laid out in 1830 as a 'second-rate street', and its residents were generally poorer than those along St George's Terrace. An 1833 plan retained the government reserve but by 1838 Assistant Surveyor A. Hillman's plan for the town of Perth extended the major east-west roads across the central reserve area, and subdivided the sections north of Hay (then Howick) Street into building lots.<sup>1</sup>

The land on which *Cremorne Arcade* was later constructed, Perth building lot Q14, was granted to Charles Dirck Wittenoom in 1840.<sup>2</sup> The city continued to develop in accordance with Roe's original plans, although northern expansion of the central city was restricted by the Perth-Fremantle railway from the 1880s.<sup>3</sup>

In October 1891, Maria Chipper (widow), Stephen James Chipper (civil servant), Henry Richard Chipper (publican) and Donald John Chipper (wheelwright), all of Perth, became owners of Perth building lots Q13 and Q14, which at the time extended from Howick (now Hay) Street through to Goderich (now Murray) Street. The title shows a right of way running half way down between the two lots. By 1893 both lots had been completely transferred to Stephen James Chipper. <sup>4</sup>

In June 1896, Cremorne Theatre was opened, situated on the northern section of Lots Q13 and Q14. Mrs Annie Oliver, a widow, is noted as the owner of the theatre and adjacent Cremorne Picture Gardens and Cremorne Hotel.<sup>5</sup> As all of these were located on Lots Q13 and Q14, it is likely that Annie Oliver had taken possession in the early 1890s and amendments to the title were delayed. The arcade buildings on Lot Q14 are not mentioned in the series of articles describing the opening of the Theatre. These reports give the impression that the land surrounding the Theatre is taken up by Cremorne Gardens.<sup>6</sup> Cremorne Picture

Register of Heritage Places – Assessment Documentation 8 April 2007

3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> G. Seddon & D. Ravine, *A City and its Setting Images of Perth, Western Australia* (Fremantle Arts Centre Press, 1986), pp. 84, 87, 100.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Land Grant T.I.B. No. 368 and 581.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Seddon & Ravine op.cit. pp118-120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.40 Fol.383.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The West Australian, 25 June 1896, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The West Australian, 25 June 1896, p. 2; 26 June 1896, p. 2.

Gardens had opened for the summer of 1895-96, and was the earliest recorded outdoor cinema in the State.<sup>7</sup>

The first record of shops at the Howick (now Hay) Street end of the Lots is in the Rate Books for 1896. The owner is recorded as 'Estate of Chipper'. Annie Oliver is noted as occupying the hotel facing Goderich (now Murray) Street, and the only occupant of the shops listed is a hairdressers. From the following year, the place appears to have been fully operational, as it is listed as shops and offices, with occupants including a financier, barber and publican. The street numbers at this time were 362-64, with a gap between these shops and Bon Marche at 368-70.<sup>8</sup>

In March 1897, the southern portion of Lot Q13 was transferred to Annie Oliver, widow, of Perth. In 1899, she also obtained the southern portion of Lot Q14, where *Cremorne Arcade* was later built. A sketch on the Title from December 1899 shows the original Lots Q13 and Q14 as being vacant at the Howick (now Hay) Street end, with a building at the northern (Goderich/Murray Street) end of the Lots, predominantly on Lot Q14.<sup>9</sup> Since Cremorne Theatre was already recorded as operating from the site prior to this, it appear that this 1899 sketch does not include all buildings on the lots at the time.

A number of tenants who were to be long-term occupants took up leases in the complex during this period. C.W. (Christopher) Garland is first recorded at number 364 Hay Street in 1899. He remained until 1913, and is variously listed during this time as occupying both offices and a store, and in some years as a clerk. Fred Blakely Dalton, a Secretary, occupied an office on the ground floor from 1901 for over a decade.<sup>10</sup>

Another long-term tenant, first listed in 1901, was Charles Harper and Co., importers of musical instruments, who remained until well into the 1920s, occupying a show room that is variously recorded as being at the rear, in Cremorne Lane, and at the first-floor.<sup>11</sup> Charles Harper was a trained musician from Melbourne who had come to Perth in 1895 to take up a position on the musical staff at Cremorne Gardens, where he eventually became managing musical director. He specialised in violins, where he was considered an expert in the field, although his store was a major importer of pianos and organs. Harper was elected as a Councillor for Victoria Park from 1905, and served as Mayor from 1909. After the amalgamation of Victoria Park with Perth City, he served as Lord Mayor of Perth from 1937 to 1939. In time, Charles Harper and Co., expanded their range to trade in electrical appliances as well. Harper died in 1954.<sup>12</sup> Harper was married to Barbara Anderson, and they had three children.

The pediment of the eastern end of the building bears the inscription 'AD 1901'. It is not clear whether this is an entirely new building or if extensions were made to an earlier structure. C.W. Garland's consistent occupancy from 1899 suggests that at least some of the 1896/97 building remained. However, the number of tenants dramatically increases from 1901, suggesting that significant additional tenancy space became available at this time. From 1901, the place is listed as 'Cremorne Lane' in the Rate Books. Traders at Cremorne Lane prior to World War One include a plumber, carpenter, tentmaker, hairdresser, caterer,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> V. Geneve 'The Picture Gardens of Western Australia' in *Trust News*, April 1998, pp. 8-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1895-1897.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Certificates of Titles Vol.10 Fol.177 and Vol. 166 Fol.146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1899-1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1899-1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> J.S. Battye, *The Cyclopedia of Western Australia*, (The Cyclopedia Company, Perth, 1912-13, Facsimile Edition Hesperian Press, Victoria Park, WA, 1985) Vol. 1. pp. 561-62; *Municipal and Road Board Gazette*, June 1954, p. 28.

tobacconist, ironmonger, fruit grower and a number of painters. In addition, office space was used by J.A. Green of the WA Supply Co., and A.H. Hearnden.<sup>13</sup>

By 1910, the street had been reconfigured to its current numbering, with the eastern section of the building renumbered as 572-574. In 1913, number 578 is listed for the first time, indicating that the western section of the building was constructed at about this time.<sup>14</sup> A.H Hearnden, who had previously occupied first floor offices at 572-574, is listed as the first occupant of the new building. A.H. Hearnden occupied offices and a shop at number 578, being the majority of the building, and remained in occupation there for over a decade.<sup>15</sup>

An undated watercolour of Cremorne Arcade may date from about this time as it includes people in Edwardian dress. The painting shows an irregular shaped laneway flanked by a mixture of single and double storey buildings to the east and west. There are doors and windows along both sides of the laneway, flush with the walls. A skillion roofed verandah projects from the western wall into the southern end of the laneway. The building at the end of the lane is two storeys with a gable roof running east-west. There is a tall, arched opening at ground level in this building with the word 'Cremorne' written above. There are two windows above the sign at first floor level, and a third dormer window above and to the west in the roof. The windows appear to be small paned sash windows. A tall chimney is evident in the western section of the building.<sup>16</sup>

From 1913, the Young Australia League (YAL) took up the space at 572-74 that had been occupied by A.H. Hearnden. For over a decade, YAL occupied up to seven offices in the Cremorne Lane complex. YAL was founded in Western Australia in 1905 by John Joseph Simons. Initially linked with the West Australian Football Association, it soon expanded its activities to include literature, debating, sport, theatrical productions and band music. The League's concern was to develop a patriotic Australian spirit among young boys through state, national and international educational tours, designed to cultivate an appreciation of and pride in their Australian heritage. It was ostensibly a non-political, non-sectarian organisation. From the 1920s, branches were established in other states. In November 1924, the Perth branch opened their purpose-built headquarters in Murray Street, and vacated *Cremorne Arcade*.<sup>17</sup>

In 1920, a billiard saloon is listed as operating from the basement. It is not known how long the basement was in use for this purpose.<sup>18</sup>

Following the death of Annie Oliver, the place was purchased in January 1923 by William Quirk, a retired farmer, of Horse Shoe Coffee Palace, Murray Street, Perth. The southern portions of Lot Q14 was combined onto one Title and assigned as Lots 1, 2 and 11. Signwriters, painters and decorators Walter Patterson Mestons and Frederick Leonard Walters are recorded as taking up a ten year lease on the place, beginning January 1925, but it appears that they had relinquished their lease by early 1926.<sup>19</sup> By the late 1920s, a complete change of tenants had taken place from the time of Annie Oliver's ownership. Long-term tenants Charles Harper and Co. and A.H. Hearndon had both left.<sup>20</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1899-1915.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Number 576 is never listed. 1948/53 Sewerage Plans show 574 separated from 578 by a narrow walkway, which presumably takes the place of 576.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1912-1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> B. Chapman, *The Colonial Eye* (Art Gallery of Western Australia, 1979), p. 82

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Register Documentation for P2052 YAL Building, 1996.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1920.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.821 Fol.62. Later leases marked on the title are illegible.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1924-30.

In 1928, ownership was transferred to retired photographer Samuel Maurice Stein, who is later recorded as a 'property owner'.<sup>21</sup> He also owned a number of other properties in Hay Street at the time.<sup>22</sup> In 1929, Oldham, Boas and Ednie-Brown Architects drew plans for Stein for major redevelopment of the place. These plans show a private right of way between 574 and 578 Hay Street. New 12-inch deep showcases were to be added to both sides of this access way, and the overall reconfiguration of the redeveloped complex was to create an open-air arcade. Shop fronts to the arcade were cement rendered. All outbuildings were removed from the site at this time. The Hay Street elevation was unchanged except for a new collapsible gate across the entrance to the arcade.<sup>23</sup>

The 1929 plans show three new shops with large show windows added to the rear of the c. 1913 section at 578 Hay Street (Shops 3, 4 and 5). This portion of the building was slightly narrower than the 1901 section. The front shop (Shop 1), which faced Hay Street, had a new show window added to its rear section, and a new entrance added near the staircase. Shop 2 also had a new show window. An archway was added to frame the entrance from the access way to the stairs. Shop 1 wrapped around the stairwell. Five new offices were added at the first floor, two of which were located above the existing Shop 1 and Shop 2. A balcony ran the length of the eastern elevation at the first floor to provide access to these offices. At the rear a bridge connected the new building to the rear of 572-574, providing access to its first floor. At both ground and first floor, floor levels were staggered to accommodate the declining slope of the block.<sup>24</sup>

The existing building at 572-574 Hay Street in 1929 comprised at ground floor of two long narrow shops facing Hay Street. Stairs accessing the basement were located between 574 Hay Street and the access way into the new arcade. Plans for the first floor have not been located. The redevelopment plans show a new two-storey brick and corrugated iron building added to the rear of 572-574. At ground level, this consisted of three east-west aligned shops facing west into the arcade (Shops 6, 7 and 8). Above these shops was a large single room, roughly square in shape. The rear of the existing 572-574 Hay Street building was altered to provide additional doorways and a large escape stair. A bridge from the landing of the escape stairs provided access to the first floor of the new building. The rear building was initially planned with a lean-to roof, but this was changed to a flat roof with 3 foot 6 inch high cyclone wire balustrades.<sup>25</sup>

In 1930, the main tenant at Number 578 was Wall & France. In the same year, Samuel Stein is listed as occupying a significant number of shops and offices 'at rear'. 'Cremorne Lane' is not identified, which may indicate that the 'Cremorne Lane' section of the place was vacant during the place's redevelopment. In following years, 'Cremorne Arcade' is listed at the address, together with shops and offices at numbers 572, 574 and 578. A hall, which had not previously been listed, is identified as being above numbers 572 and 574.<sup>26</sup>

Samuel Stein continued to occupy an office in the arcade into the early 1940s. Various associations tenanted the hall, including Tatts Sports Club in the 1930s, and the Eureka Club or Eureka Youth League in the 1940s. A gradually increasing number of women are listed as tenants. By this time, it appears that few, if any, of the trades which were occupants at the turn of the twentieth century now rented rooms at the place. This is indicative of changes to the

6

<sup>21</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.1054 Fol.793.

<sup>22</sup> City of Perth Rate Books - Central Ward, 1924-30.

<sup>23</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans G504/29.

<sup>24</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans G504/29.

<sup>25</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans G504/29, H426/30 and A643/33.

<sup>26</sup> City of Perth Rate Books - Central Ward, 1930-1946.

**Register of Heritage Places – Assessment Documentation** 

character of the area as it became the business and retail centre of a growing capital city.<sup>27</sup>

A 1948 Sewerage Plan shows a narrow laneway between numbers 572-574 and 578. For the first section of this laneway, at first-floor level, these two buildings are connected. The rear of number 578, identified as a separate section from the front of the building, stretches to the rear (north) Lot boundary. A stairway is shown at the rear of number 574. To the rear of numbers 572-574, abutting the northern Lot boundary, is a freestanding brick building, which appears to front onto a walkway behind numbers 572-574. A laneway also runs between 570 and 572, noted as having granolithic paving, and connecting with steps into the recreation area of lawns and swimming baths behind the Murray Street YMCA building, on the site of the former Cremorne Picture Gardens. The rear sections of this laneway are noted as having extensive lighting, and the alley behind number 572-574 appears to connect with it. Lightwells for the basement of number 572-574 are noted on both sides of the building. The footprint of the building matches the 1929 plans, indicating they were completed as designed.<sup>28</sup>

Following Stein's death in 1955, the place was transferred to Annie Leah Stein, widow, of Mount Lawley.<sup>29</sup> The following year, plans were approved for Mr E.P. (Ted) McDonald to convert 572 Hay Street into a betting shop. Elements removed for this conversion included a pantry, suggesting that previous tenants of the place had used it as an eating-house of some sort.<sup>30</sup> The betting shop was expanded in 1958. An office was created in the rear of the adjacent shop (574 Hay Street) with a doorway cut to provide access from the betting shop at 572.<sup>31</sup>

In 1965, to accommodate a T.A.B., Oldham, Boas, Ednie-Brown and Partners drew plans to reconfigure the rear of 572-574, shortening both of the shops facing Hay Street. The party wall between the rear sections of these shops was to be removed to create a roughly square area accessed from the arcade. It was estimated that the changes would cost £1800. The building application shows the owner as Nangana Pty Ltd, although they were not on the Certificate of Title.<sup>32</sup>

Approval was granted in 1962 for A & K Alfirevich to convert Shop 1 at 578 Hay Street into Arcadia Café. Entrances and windows to the arcade were closed in. The rear section, beyond the stairwell, became the restaurant kitchen.<sup>33</sup>

In 1966, ownership transferred to Frederick George Stone, Hanesworth Arthur Walton (both chartered accountants of Perth) and Joseph Nairn Shohet, retired banker, of Singapore, as tenants in common.<sup>34</sup> The following year, J.N. Shohet & S.G. Stone & Co were granted approval for a new steel escape stair to the rear of 572-574 Hay Street, including cutting in new doors.<sup>35</sup>

As suburban Perth expanded, with associated local shopping areas, central Perth declined as a retail area. In 1956-57, the CBD accounted for 37.7% of all metropolitan retail sales. By 1968-69, this had dropped to only 20.8%. Food

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> City of Perth Rate Books – Central Ward, 1930-1946.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Metropolian Sewerage Plan City of Perth SROWA Cons. 4156 Sheet 59, 1948 revised 1953.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.1054 Fol.793.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 1216/56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 676/58.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 1087/65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 1180/62

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.1054 Fol.793.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 781/67

outlets were particularly badly hit by the decline, coming to depend almost entirely on office workers rather than retail shoppers for custom.<sup>36</sup>

Approval was granted in 1971 to convert Shop 6 into a men's exclusive hairdressers, 'The Inn Trim'. The shop is identified as 576 Hay Street, the only source located that refers to any of the buildings on site as number 576. The lessee at the time was S. Finkelstein.<sup>37</sup> Further changes to a shop front were approved in 1976, but it is not known which shop this related to.<sup>38</sup>

In December 1975, Cremorne Arcade made front-page headlines when *The West Australian* recounted a murder at the place. Two victims were attacked in an office near the top of the stairs: Mrs Margaret Worthington, aged 41 of Bedford Park, was knifed to death, and Mr Aldo Pace, aged 47 of Lesmurdie, was critically wounded. Pace had a lecture room in the Arcade complex, where he gave lessons in Italian language and culture. He was director of the Italian Cultural Lyceum, a tenant of the place at the time.<sup>39</sup>

After his death in 1975, Joseph Shohet's undivided fourth share of the property was transferred to Gladys Suad Nassim, married woman, of Mount Lawley, Sylvia Suham Silferman of Dianella, and Frederick Stone.<sup>40</sup> In May 1978, one undivided fourth share was transferred to Isaac Freddie Nassim, Investor, of the same Mt Lawley address.<sup>41</sup>

From the late 1970s, the City of Perth responded to the retail crisis by implementing programs to revitalise sales in the central city. Lack of free parking was seen as a barrier to shopping in the city. Through the 1980s and early 1990s many campaigns and slogans were put in place, but the only move that appears to have impacted the ongoing decline of city retail was the change of late night shopping from Thursday to Friday in 1989.<sup>42</sup>

Approval was granted in 1980 to convert 572 Hay Street into a take-away food store selling merchandise such as biscuits, cakes, cheese, cold meats, salads, chocolates and sweets. The ground-floor elevation was altered to create a receding shop front with sliding doors. There was to be no cooking on site nor tables provided. The owner of the shop is identified as J.W. Humphrey and the builder as J. Hughes.<sup>43</sup>

In 1985, the various portions of the land were brought together into one title. The remaining undivided half share was in the ownership of Gladys Suad Nassim, married woman, Sylvia Suham Silferman, married woman and trained nurse, and Colin Anthony Peacock, chartered accountant, as tenants in common.<sup>44</sup> In August 1986, the place was transferred to McDonalds Properties (Australia) Pty Ltd, who retained ownership to 2006.<sup>45</sup> McDonalds opened their first store in Australia in Sydney in 1971, and had been operating in Western Australia from the early 1980s.<sup>46</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Gregory, Jenny, *City of Light: a History of Perth since the 1950s,* City of Perth, 2003, pp.183-84.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 806/71.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> City of Perth building file search, on HCWA file PD1988

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> West Australian, 4 December 1975, p.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Certificates of Title Vol.1462 Fol.052 and Vol.1054 Fol.793.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.1504 Fol.052

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Gregory, Jenny, *City of Light: a History of Perth since the 1950s,* City of Perth, 2003, pp.287-89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 1028/80.

<sup>44</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.1702 Fol.266

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Certificate of Title Vol.1737 Fol.153

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Chris Platt, McDonalds Senior Development Manager WA/SA, at site visit 4 November 2004.

Soon after McDonalds took ownership, plans were drawn for a major redevelopment to create a Fast Food Restaurant. The plans show the majority of the buildings behind the façade removed, including Shop 1 (578 Hay Street), the 1960s TAB and Shops 2 to 8 that had previously faced in the arcade. The 1930 building to the rear of 572 has been removed and a parking area created. The only remaining element shown on these plans is 572 Hay Street, which is shortened, with a stairwell added in what was originally the centre of the store, and the rear section being reconfigured as a second shop. A new arcade is shown running the length of the Lot to the west of 572 Hay Street. The second shop at the rear of 572 now opens into this arcade. The western portion of the Lot, approximately half of its area, is taken up with a new McDonalds restaurant, the front half of which is an open-plan dining area, with the remainder being kitchen and utility space. Plans for the basement and first floors were not available, but the original access to the basement is shown to be closed off.<sup>47</sup>

Further redevelopment plans were drawn in 1987 and McDonalds received approval to alter the building to convert it to a McDonalds fast food outlet. At this time basement lightwells were bricked up and the basement converted to a dining area. Ground floor shop fronts were cut in 3.125 metres from the original front elevation, creating an overhang across the public walkway in front of the place, and new wide columns were constructed to support the first floor facade. The remnant original section, 572 Hay Street, was restored to its early length, aside from the loss of the cut in area at the front. The floor-space of the McDonalds restaurant was dramatically increased in area so that the entire block was filled. An elevator was added adjacent to 572 Hay Street, with a stairwell to the basement immediately behind it. Concertina glass doors were installed in front of the elevator and over half the width of the McDonald's storefront. The western section had a recessed entry formed of full-height fixed glass panels and sliding glass doors. The majority of the ground floor area was an open plan dining area, with kitchen, staff rooms and utilities at the rear of the building wrapping the rear of 572 Hay Street. A second restaurant was created at the first floor, using the full width of the block, with its dining located in the front half of the building. What was previously the front western wall of the 1901 section was retained as a feature wall in the restaurant dining area. A fireplace in this section of wall was retained, together with another opposite it in the eastern wall of the building. A large office space was created at the rear of the first floor, behind the kitchen for the second restaurant.48

As part of the 1987 redevelopment, the first floor façade of the building was renovated. Boarding was removed and decorative plaster was restored. Front windows were made good, as were a number of east-facing windows overlooking the neighbouring Right of Way. It is not known for how long prior to this the place had been boarded over and deteriorating.<sup>49</sup>

McDonald's main city store relocated from its original location behind Cinema City to *Cremorne Arcade* following the redevelopment, and continued to trade from the ground floor until late 2003.<sup>50</sup> Further alterations were made in 1995, when the restaurant was extended to provide a 'McCafé'.<sup>51</sup> Laminated glass screens were affixed to the front columns of the place later in the same year,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Undated plans drawn for McDonalds by Peter Hunt Architect in the early 1980s, courtesy of the architect.

<sup>48 1987</sup> Redevelopment Plans drawn for McDonalds by Peter Hunt Architect, courtesy of the architect.
49 1087 Redevelopment Plans drawn for McDonalds by Peter Hunt Architect, courtesy of the architect.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> 1987 Redevelopment Plans drawn for McDonalds by Peter Hunt Architect, courtesy of the architect.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Chris Platt, McDonalds Senior Development Manager WA/SA, at site visit 4 November 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> City of Perth building file search, on HCWA file PD1988

creating a semi-enclosed al fresco dining area in front of the store.<sup>52</sup> Coldale Constructions undertook the work on both these projects.<sup>53</sup>

Pizza Hut operated a restaurant from the first floor for approximately ten years through the 1990s. After Pizza Hut vacated the premises, McDonalds was unable to lease the upstairs area and it remained unused.<sup>54</sup>

At City of Perth's Council meeting on 1 February 2005, it was decided to declare *Cremorne Arcade* to be significant and worthy of conservation in accordance with Clause 30(1) of City of Perth City Planning Scheme No. 2. As such, *Cremorne Arcade* is included in the Register of Places of Cultural Heritage Significance under the provisions of City of Perth City Planning Scheme No. 2.<sup>55</sup>

At it's meeting on 26 April 2005, the City of Perth Council approved an application to retain and restore a portion of *Cremorne Arcade*, and for the construction of a 16 level mixed use development containing 46 multiple dwellings, office and retail tenancies and car parking. The proposal involved retaining and restoring the front portion of *Cremorne Arcade* to a depth of approximately 7.5 metres from the front boundary, with the rear portion of the building to be demolished.<sup>56</sup>

By April 2006, all of *Cremorne Arcade* was vacant; a newsagent who had been trading in 572 Hay Street having closed.

# 13.2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

*Cremorne Arcade* is a two-storey brick, stucco, and iron building in the Federation Free Classical style<sup>57</sup>, with a basement, shops at the ground floor and commercial spaces at the first floor, built for Annie Oliver. Early sections of the place were constructed in 1896/97, with major development, including the façade, completed in 1901. Further major additions were made in 1913 and 1930. In 1987, the place underwent significant redevelopment for its conversion to a McDonalds restaurant and no longer resembles the lane or later arcade that were the original and early iterations.

*Cremorne Arcade* is located east of the Hay Street Mall in a section of Hay Street that retains a collection of late nineteenth and early twentieth century buildings, with substantial sections of late twentieth century buildings such as Cinema City. On the opposite side of the street, there is a grouping of important heritage places including the *Perth Town Hall* and the Titles Office, part of the *Central Government Buildings*. Cathedral Avenue divides the southern streetblock, with the Law Chambers and Deloitte Building completing the southern side of the street to the east of Cathedral Avenue, both late twentieth century buildings of eight stories or so.

*Cremorne Arcade* occupies the whole of its site, with a lane and low-rise late twentieth century building to the east, single-storey structure to the rear and the Cinema City structure to the west on the site of the old Bon Marché department store.

*Cremorne Arcade* is a two-storey brick, stucco, and iron building in the Federation Free Classical style in two distinct façade components, with a basement, shops at the ground floor and commercial spaces at the first floor. The

<sup>55</sup> City of Perth correspondence dated 14/12/05, file P1988

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> City of Perth Archived Plans 95/0687.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> City of Perth building file search, on HCWA file PD1988

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Chris Platt, McDonalds Senior Development Manager WA/SA, at site visit 4 November 2004.

<sup>56</sup> ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Apperly, R., Irving, R., Reynolds, P., *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture. Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus and Roberston, North Ryde, 1989. pp. 104-107.

history of the development can be read in the facades, with a symmetrical three bay classically derived façade to the west, and in a different but complimentary classical form, a four bay symmetrical building to the east. The only remaining evidence of the position of the lane and later arcade is the location of the paired columns in the western building.

The façade of the western building comprises clad columns on the ground floor, with a 3-metre deep colonnade back to the shop fronts. The shop fronts comprise automatic glazed doors and aluminium framed glazed folding doors. Above the colonnade there is a panelled frieze and pilaster capitals, topped by a cornice. The upper floor is divided into three bays by giant order lonic pilasters, with a deep entablature and balustrade to terminate the roofline. All of the masonry has a stucco finish and has been painted. Each of the three bays has panelled pilasters, imposts, and round head arches, with single pane double hung sash windows. There are the remains of a large internally illuminated box sign on the front, two up-lights, and hooks on each of the three pilasters that indicate the points of attachment of the earlier awning over the street. The return or western elevation is painted brickwork and there is a new flat metal deck roof over this section of the building.

The eastern section of the building is divided into two bays on the ground floor. There is a shop against the eastern wall (572 Hay Street), and stairs and escalator to the first floor against the western side (formerly 574 Hay Street). The upper facade is divided into major and minor bays, with pedimented major bays to the east and west and two minor bays between. The major bays are set forward and emphasised by a dado string, plain-based pilasters, with fluted top shafts, and Corinthian capitals. This is capped by an entablature with an egg and dart moulding, then plain pediments. A parapet wall links the pediments and then a series of decorative pediments terminate major and minor bays at roof level. broken pediments to the east and west and a plain pediment raised above the eastern and western pediments at the centre. Stucco chimneys rise out of both the east and west gable walls. In the central top panel there is a bas relief date A.D. 1901. In this building there are four sets of doors at first floor level with hopper lights over them. Each of pair of doors is set within a pilastered bay, with imposts and round head arches. The doors are paired and panelled at the bottom, and glazed at the top. There is no indication as to whether the upper verandah was roofed or simply balustraded. The east wall is gabled at the front of the building, then a plain parapetted wall for the remainder of the building. The original sections of wall are laid in English garden wall bond and the remainder in stretcher bond. There is evidence of windows filled in and of basement lights that have also been filled in.

Once a lane and later an arcade, the building and its floor levels have been completely reconfigured internally to form a single entity that can and has been divided into a variety of uses.

The basement is entered off the old lane or arcade axis, but all of the accommodation is located under the eastern building noted in the exterior elevation description. The area comprises a dining area, toilets and a computer room, plant room and access stair to ground floor level at the rear, with a semi circular plan main access stair at the front. There are modern tiled floors, plastered and partition walls and suspended ceiling throughout. Apart from the containing perimeter walls, there is no evidence of the original building layout or finishes.

The ground floor is laid out as a major restaurant tenancy on the western side, with an escalator and stair up to first floor level in the eastern building and a shop tenancy along the eastern wall. The front of the building is a dining area, with

around half the floor plan to the rear being offices, kitchens, training area, amenities and service area. The shop is fitted out as a news agency and the restaurant retains the former McDonalds layout and finishes, including tiled floors, plastered and clad walls, built in seating and tables, suspended ceilings and the like. Apart from the containing external walls, the original building layout and finishes are obscured or lost.

The first floor level has stairs and escalator up to it and is laid out in a similar fashion to the ground floor. The planning and finishes are much the same as the ground floor, with one distinguishing feature that is different. The brick walls of the original building have been left in place along the front elevation and for around 7 metres back from the front walls, leaving fireplaces in situ. Plaster has been stripped from the walls to reveal the brickwork. The walls correspond to the remaining gable walls that can be seen from the exterior. Beyond these wall lines, nothing remains of the original building to the north.

The majority of the roof is now flat metal decking, with access ways and air conditioning plant arranged around the roofscape. The gable roof remains at the front of the building, and there is a section of the gabled roof that once ran over the eastern building in the north-south direction.

The significant alterations include the removal of original shop fronts and creation of a colonnade, the homogenization of the various original building elements into a single building and the loss of evidence of the individual building components in the process. Beyond the first nine metres of the street front there is very little original material and no evidence of original finishes.

*Cremorne Arcade* has undergone many changes throughout its history, partly to accommodate changing needs and uses and partly for maintenance purposes. This has led to continual erosion of the original fabric and loss of distinction between the components. Cumulative maintenance and significant change related to usage have detracted from the place and its presentation. Only a small part of the place is occupied and little maintenance has been undertaken since the major tenants vacated. While the place is structurally sound the interiors are in fair to poor condition.

# **13.3 COMPARATIVE INFORMATION**

The HCWA database lists 306 individual shops or shopping complexes constructed between 1890 and 1905, of which 63 are identified as being constructed in the Federation Free Classical style.<sup>58</sup> Nine of these are entered into the State Register of Heritage Places, of which three are comparable:

P01990 *McNess Royal Arcade*, *Perth* is a substantial and richly ornamented three-storey commercial building constructed in 1897. The place is a fine example of the style, a prominent landmark on a corner location, and includes very intact interior detailing in the L-shaped arcade. The arcade section has been filled in with shops and no longer functions as an arcade.

P02140 *Wellington Buildings, Perth* is a three storey commercial building built in 1910, constructed in stucco-finished masonry in the Federation Free Classical style, comprising shops on the ground floor above a basement and offices on the first and second floors. The upper levels of the place have high authenticity.

P03845 *151-165 Beaufort Street* is a two-storey brick and iron group of retail buildings with residences above, constructed in 1903. This is a simpler example of the style, and represents a different tradition of commercial premises, where tenants lived on site above their shops. The place remains significantly intact.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Information from HCWA database search 18 October 2004.
 Register of Heritage Places – Assessment Documentation
 8 April 2007

Other arcades on the Register are P02002 *Gledden Buildings*, P01998 *London Court* and P02065 *Piccadilly Theatre and Arcade*, all of which were constructed in the 1930s. P02105 *Trinity Uniting Group* does not include the 1923 arcade in its Registered area. P01954 *Bon Marche Arcade*, constructed 1901, has been assessed and a decision regarding Registration is pending.

With the exception of *London Court,* these arcades were designed as interior retail groups. All retain much higher authenticity than *Cremorne Arcade.* 

*Cremorne Arcade* is a fair representative example of the façade of a commercial building of the gold boom period constructed in the Federation Free Classical style.

### 13.4 KEY REFERENCES

No key references.

#### 13.5 FURTHER RESEARCH

-----