



**HERITAGE
COUNCIL**
OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA

REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES

Removed Entry

The Heritage Council determined not to recommend this interim registered place be finalised under the Heritage Act 2018. The place is no longer a registered place and was removed from the Register on 1 July 2021.

1. **DATA BASE No.** 2891
2. **NAME** *War Memorial, York (1923; c.1994)*
OTHER NAMES Monument and Park, York; York War Memorial;
Fallen Soldier's Memorial
3. **LOCATION** Railway Street, York
4. **DESCRIPTION OF PLACE INCLUDED IN THIS ENTRY**
 1. Portion of Lot 628 on Deposited Plan 33284 being part of Reserve 46912 and being part of the land in Crown Land Title Volume 3129 Folio 16
 2. Portion of Lot 629 on Deposited Plan 33284 being part of the land in Certificate of Title Volume 2616 Folio 552
5. **LOCAL GOVERNMENT AREA** Shire of York
6. **CURRENT OWNER**
 1. State of Western Australia (Responsible Agency: Department of Lands; Management Order Holder: Shire of York)
 2. Peter Stuart May and Catherine Madeleine Brown
7. **HERITAGE LISTINGS**
 - Register of Heritage Places: Interim Registered 28/08/1992
Removed 01/07/2021
 - National Trust Classification: Classified 01/04/1985
 - Town Planning Scheme: Yes 17/10/1996
 - Municipal Inventory: Adopted 31/12/1995
 - Register of the National Estate: Nominated 25/09/1985
8. **ORDERS UNDER SECTION 38 OR 59 OF THE ACT**

9. HERITAGE AGREEMENT

10. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

War Memorial, York, comprising a World War I memorial constructed of Donnybrook stone and a granite boulder commemorating a Victoria Cross awardee, set within a small, grassed reserve, has cultural significance for the following reasons:

the place is important to the people of York for its contribution to the townscape between the Railway Station and St Patrick's Church, comprising typical and related Victorian townscape elements;

the place is esteemed by the people of York as commemorating local fallen soldiers from the area, including one of whom was awarded the Victoria Cross Medal; and

the place is a representative example of a post-World War I stone memorial constructed to commemorate fallen soldiers from the local area in regional Western Australia.

11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

PRINCIPAL AUSTRALIAN HISTORIC THEME(S)

- 8.8 Remembering the fallen
- 9.7.3 Remembering the dead

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA THEME(S)

- 407 Cultural activities
- 501 World wars and other wars
- 603 Local heroes and battlers

11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE*

War Memorial, York contributes to the aesthetic values of the surrounding townscape between the Railway Station and St Patrick's Church, comprising typical and related Victorian townscape elements.

11.2. HISTORIC VALUE

11.3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

11.4. SOCIAL VALUE

The 1923 war memorial and the granite boulder are esteemed by the people of York for their commemoration of local fallen soldiers, one of whom, Lieutenant Lawrence Domenic McCarthy, was awarded the Victoria Cross Medal. (Criterion 4.1)

War Memorial, York is important to the people of York for its contribution to the townscape between the Railway Station and St Patrick's Church, comprising typical and related Victorian townscape elements.

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12.1. RARITY

War Memorial, York is a rare example of a war memorial designed by Architects Powell and Cameron.

* For consistency, all references to architectural style are taken from Apperly, R., Irving, R., Reynolds, P. *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture. Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus and Robertson, North Ryde, 1989.
For consistency, all references to garden and landscape types and styles are taken from Ramsay, J. *Parks, Gardens and Special Trees: A Classification and Assessment Method for the Register of the National Estate*, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra, 1991, with additional reference to Richards, O. *Theoretical Framework for Designed Landscapes in WA*, unpublished report, 1997.

12.2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

War Memorial, York is a representative example of a post-World War I stone memorial constructed to commemorate fallen soldiers from the local area in regional Western Australia. (Criterion 6.2)

12.3 CONDITION

War Memorial, York is in good condition and appears to be well maintained.

12.4 INTEGRITY

The World War I Memorial and a granite boulder commemorating Lieutenant Lawrence Domenic McCarthy V.C have been retained, although a 77 mm artillery gun, apparently captured during World War II is no longer present. The place has a moderate degree of authenticity.

12.5 AUTHENTICITY

The majority of components that make up *War Memorial, York* have been retained, although a 77 mm artillery gun is no longer present. The place has a moderate degree of authenticity.

13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The following documentation is based in part on the listings for the place on the National Trust Register with amendments and/or additions by the State Heritage Office and the Register Committee.

13.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

War Memorial, York is located within a small grassed reserve located to the north of the York Railway Station.

The Memorial was constructed in 1923 of Donnybrook stone to honour those local soldiers who had fallen during World War I. The dedication ceremony service sheet, dated 25 April 1923, notes that the 'Fallen Soldier's Memorial' was designed by Architects Messrs Powell and Cameron, Perth and constructed by Designers and Contractors, the Returned Soldiers' Monumental Works Karrakatta.

The land was owned by the Western Australian Government Railways, and was leased by the then Municipality of York for a period of seven years on a peppercorn rent. In 1930, the Secretary for Railways and Municipality of York came to an agreement whereby the Council retained the lease indefinitely, unless otherwise determined with six months' notice.¹

In 1994, the Shire of York was requested to install a second memorial within the reserve, in the form of a bronze memorial plaque recognising the achievements of Lieutenant Lawrence Domenic McCarthy V.C. The exact date of its erection is unknown, however a large granite rock in the northern extent of the reserve, known as McCarthy's Stone, now bears a bronze plaque honouring Lieutenant McCarthy, who was born and raised in the York District prior to his gallant efforts during World War I, for which he was awarded the Victoria Cross. The plaque was dedicated by The York Sub-Branch of the RSL.

A 77 mm artillery gun, apparently captured during World War II in Villers-Bretonneux, France, was displayed on a concrete stand. The gun has not been present on the site since at least 2001. A letter on file dated 2001 from the York Society noted that it was being restored that year.

In 2011, conservation works were undertaken to both the 1923 stone memorial and the VC granite monument, including cleaning of the stone of both structures, repointing, and cleaning and repair of the bronze and marble plaques.

13.2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

War Memorial, York is located within a small grassed reserve located east of the railway line and north of the York Railway Station. The reserve is bounded by Railway Street which curves around the south, east and west, and by South Street to the north. *St Patrick's Catholic Church, Presbytery & Hall* is located on the opposite (northern) side of South Street, and *Convent of Mercy and School (fmr)* is located on the western side of Railway Street.

Pine log fencing and a stone wall along the western boundary line the reserve. Approximately five trees are located within the reserve which includes a carved

¹ Correspondence between Western Australian Government Railways and Municipality of York, dated 30 April 1930; 7 May 1930; 12 May 1930; 14 May 1930.

stone War Memorial and granite stone with a bronze plaque located at the northern end.

Known as the 'Fallen Soldier's Memorial' at the time of its commemoration in 1923, the World War I Memorial was designed by Architects Messrs Powell and Cameron, Perth and constructed by Designers and Contractors, the Returned Soldiers' Monumental Works Karrakatta. Constructed of Donnybrook stone, the memorial is classical in style, with a decorative plinth supporting a single composite column topped by a ball. The capital of the column is richly decorated in stucco scrolling. The plinth is supported by sets of two short columns under a semi-circular tableau. The inscription reads 'Here York Honours Those who Fell 1914, 1918'. Two c. 2003 polished marble plates bearing the names of those who died during World War I have been affixed to the base of the column on the north and south elevations.

A large granite rock is located in the northern extent of the reserve, known as McCarthy's Stone. The bronze plaque commemorates Lieutenant McCarthy, who was born and raised in the York District prior to his gallant efforts during World War I, for which he was awarded the Victoria Cross. The plaque was dedicated by The York Sub-Branch of the RSL.

A 77 mm artillery gun, apparently captured during World War II in Villers-Bretonneux, France, was formerly displayed on a concrete stand, although this currently stands empty.

13.3 COMPARATIVE INFORMATION

The death toll arising from Australian losses in World War I had a considerable impact across Western Australia. Numerous small towns lost large numbers of their menfolk overseas during the conflict. A site where the dead could be commemorated and mourned became important, particularly given that many were not buried in their home country.

A 2006 study of war memorials in Western Australia concluded that there were approximately 108 monumental memorials constructed in the Inter-War period.² This is supported by a search of the State Heritage Office database which returns a total of 113 entries for Monuments constructed between 1920 and 1945. Of those, a total of 99 places include the keyword 'war', including 16 places on the State Register of Heritage Places, four child entries of Register places, and three places on the Assessment Program. The following comparable examples are listed below.

- P1039 *North Fremantle War Memorial* (RHP): a granite pillar surmounted by a finely detailed statue of imported marble, erected in 1919 in commemoration of the citizens of the district who had lost their lives in World War I. An additional roll was added in 1945.
- P14769 *Memorial Gardens & Recreation Reserve, Mount Lawley* (RHP): a sporting and civic complex which includes an Inter-War Art Deco War Memorial (1924) as well as other community facilities Bowling Club, Tennis Club (fmr), bowling greens and tennis courts, children's playground, open spaces and mature plantings.

² Stephens, J; August 2012, 'Circuits of Memory: The War Memory Boom in Western Australia', *Societies* 2012, 2, pp. 84–85.

- P13617 *Nedlands War Memorial* (RHP): comprises a five-metre high war memorial constructed in 1940 of Donnybrook stone in the Inter-War Art Deco style and rare as the only war memorial constructed with a commemorative light in Western Australia.
- P1819 *Narrogin Memorial Park & War Memorial Pavilion* (RHP): an informally landscaped memorial park comprising lawn, trees, gardens, facilities, bench seats with commemorative plaques, remnant wartime relics or trophies, and the Inter-War Free Classical style painted Donnybrook stone Memorial Pavilion. Originally constructed in 1922, additional plaques have been added over time.
- P12211 Tammin Civic Precinct (Assessment Program): includes the Memorial Park and Gates (a small grassed park delineated by the four red brick piers and wrought iron gates. Each pier has a commemorative plaque, including World War II, Vietnam or 50 years since World War II). The precinct includes the Town Hall, and other civic buildings.

Many of the places listed in the database were identified as part of the Statewide War Memorial Survey, and no additional information is provided beyond their location. However the following comparable examples illustrate war memorials similar to *War Memorial, York* which have been identified as having local significance, including those which have been assessed as below the threshold for the State Register:

- P4043 Maylands Hall, War Memorial & Gardens: comprises Maylands Library, originally constructed in 1921 as the Maylands Hall, set in landscaped gardens which contain a War Memorial, rose garden and a lawn area. The war memorial is an obelisk on a stepped limestone base. (Assessed Below Threshold, February 2003)
- P13481 Busselton War Memorial: A bronze and limestone cenotaph style war memorial that sits on a stone platform inscribed with words 'Honour the Brave' and 'The Heroic Dead', built to commemorate the heroic deeds of those who fought for liberty and freedom during the World War I, World War II, Korean War and the Vietnam War. (Does not warrant assessment, August 2011)
- P7407 Bassendean War Memorial, World War I & World War II: modestly scaled granite obelisk with a rough execution mounted on a wide, square base and plinth, inscribed on the four faces of the base with the names of 154 Bassendean men who served in World War I, 26 of whom died. (Does not warrant assessment, March 2009)
- P2387 South Perth War Memorial: A stone and brick memorial consisting of a semi-circular brick wall with stone capping with a stone pillar at each end topped with a decorative metal fixture. Between the two ends of the wall is a stone plinth which supports a German 170mm field gun or mortar captured during World War I. (City of South Perth MI)
- P8533 Mundaring War Memorial & Gardens, Mundaring: The memorial is a blue-grey granite needle form on a steeped base with engraved marble memorial plaques around the base. An avenue of roses runs

back to the north in a bed edged with matching stone. (Shire of Mundaring MI)

- P11817 Dongara War Memorial: A granite obelisk on a stepped base dedicated to men in the district who died in World War I. Constructed in the 1920s in the cemetery and relocated to the memorial park in 1938. (Shire of Irwin MI)
- P11011 Peace Park Memorial, Moora: A delicate tapered stone column surmounted by a decorative cross set on a high octagonal plinth in a memorial park. The park has commemorative gates containing the words 'Lest We Forget'. The memorial was established by the soldier's memorial committee and its chairman EHB Lefroy. (Shire of Moora MI)

The above comparisons demonstrate that individual memorials are generally unlikely to demonstrate significance at a State level, when compared to precincts or larger places which also demonstrate another aspect of history, architectural or technical excellence or other cultural value of importance to Western Australia.

A search of the State Heritage Office database for places associated with Architects Powell and Cameron returns eleven entries including the following:

- P2880 *York Town Hall* (RHP), constructed in 1911 by Wright, Powell & Cameron, Architects.
- P2441 Methodist Church (fmr), Subiaco - designed by Powell, Cameron & Chisholm, Architects, constructed in 1932 (Does not warrant assessment).
- P1181 Shire Council Chambers, Harvey (1935), designed by Powell, Cameron & Chisholm, Architects.
- P10456 Pasadena, Kalamunda (1930), designed by Powell, Cameron & Chisholm, Architects.

A study of war memorials in Western Australia has concluded that 'the majority of war memorials in Western Australia were usually designed by local monumental masons or chosen from their war memorial catalogue'.³ It is possible that *War Memorial, York* is the only example of a war memorial designed by Powell and Cameron. However, this is still unlikely to elevate the significance of *War Memorial, York* to the threshold of importance to the state of Western Australia, when compared to the other war memorials previously considered by the Heritage Council's Register Committee.

13.4 KEY REFERENCES

13.5 FURTHER RESEARCH

³ Stephens, J, 'Community meaning and heritage of Western Australian war memorials', Curtin University — Australia at War and Peace, Source: http://research.humanities.curtin.edu.au/groups/awp/pdf/Community_meaning_John_Stephens.pdf, Accessed 14 August 2015.