



REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES - ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE*

Annesley is an excellent example of the Federation Queen Anne style. (Criterion 1.1)

Its well considered and finely executed design displays artistic excellence. (Criterion 1.2)

The large 'L' shaped plan clearly addresses both frontages and by being set back from the corner and having a substantial and attractive front garden, *Annesley* displays a landmark quality. (Criterion 1.4)

11.2. HISTORIC VALUE

Annesley is one of the largest early residences built in the Mount Lawley Estate and the construction of the place helped establish the visual and social character of the area. (Criterion 2.2)

The landscaped gardens at *Annesley* are indicative of the garden suburb ideal that was being promoted at the time. (Criterion 2.2)

11.3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

11.4. SOCIAL VALUE

Being an attractive and imposing home of an earlier era, set in a large garden fitting for the period of the place, *Annesley* is highly valued by the local community. Its past use as a rest home, private hospital and nursing home add to its social value. The garden has been awarded 'Best Heritage Garden' by the Mount Lawley Society. (Criterion 4.1)

* For consistency, all references to architectural style are taken from Apperly, Richard; Irving, Robert and Reynolds, Peter *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus & Robertson, North Ryde, 1989.

Annesley is a particularly fine example of the type of early residence built in Mount Lawley and, as such, contributes considerably to the local community's sense of place. (Criterion 4.2)

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12. 1. RARITY

While Federation Queen Anne houses are not rare, the size and quality of *Annesley*, as well as its siting and garden make it an uncommon structure, in this part of Western Australia. (Criterion 5.1)

12. 2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

Annesley is characteristic of its class; a large Federation Queen Anne residence. (Criterion 6.1)

Annesley and the surrounding suburb of Mount Lawley are characteristic of the garden suburb movement, which promoted highly crafted buildings set in green and gracious environs. (Criterion 6.2)

12. 3 CONDITION

Annesley is in excellent condition.

12. 4 INTEGRITY

Integrity is high. The original intention, that of residence, is intact.

12. 5 AUTHENTICITY

The plans, dated May 1986 by architect Michael Lake, indicate demolition of two rooms to the rear, and it would appear that this has taken place. Otherwise, the fabric, apart from the 1986 extensions, appears to be in an original state. Authenticity is moderate.

13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The documentary evidence has been compiled by Irene Ham-Sauman, Historian. The physical evidence has been compiled by John Loreck, Architect.

13.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

Annesley is a large Federation Queen Anne style brick and tile home.¹ It was built for Percy W. Armstrong and his wife, who first occupied the place in 1914. In 1953, *Annesley* was converted for use as a hospital/nursing home, a function it served for some 28 years. The place was renovated and extended by the current owners after they purchased the property in 1984, at which time it reverted to a residence.

Mount Lawley was originally divided into two parcels of land. Swan Location Z was bounded by the Swan River to Wanneroo Road, and from Walcott Street to the line of First Avenue and through to Bradford Street. Swan Location Y incorporated the area between East Street, Maylands to North Street, and from First Avenue to Dundas Road.

In 1833, Location Y was granted to Joshua Gregory who established an inn to serve the early road traffic between Perth and Guildford.² However, early development in Mount Lawley was slow. This was mainly because a great deal of the traffic between Perth and Guildford bypassed the area as colonists travelled on the Swan River. When the Fremantle to Guildford railway line opened in 1881, no railway station was built at Mt Lawley as there was insufficient population in the district to warrant one.³

In 1900, John Robinson and Samuel Copley purchased Swan Location Z, comprising 720 acres, for £7525.⁴ The land had been originally granted to Charles Bourne in December 1840.⁵ It was Robinson and Copley who initiated the naming of the Mount Lawley area. In 1901, the area was named after Sir Arthur Lawley, Governor of Western Australia.⁶

Samuel Copley was a barber by trade. He developed ferry and bus services in Perth, as well as speculating in land and houses, and various other business ventures.⁷ Robert Robinson came from Ireland with his parents in 1878. He trained as a barrister and, in 1914, was appointed King's Counsel. He was a

¹ Apperly, R., Irving, R. & Reynolds, P. *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and terms from 1788 to the Present* Sydney, Angus & Robertson, 1994. pp. 132-135; *Wise's Post Office Directory* 1914. Note: The spelling of *Annesley* is taken from the Western Australian Telephone Directories of 1953-1981 when the place was a hospital/nursing home.

² Location Y became known as 'Pineapple Bay'. In 1908 was bought by important Perth businessman Albany Bell, who built a home and factory on the land.

³ Hamilton, Margaret *Mount Lawley: The first 150 years 1829-1979* Perth, Mt Lawley Society, 1979. pp. 3-5.

⁴ *ibid.*, p. 23.

⁵ Shearwood, G. & O. B. 'Original Crown Grants (1833-1844) and Localities within the City of Stirling' Perth, 1988. pp. 28-29.

⁶ Hamilton, *op cit*, p. 23. Apparently, the Lawley's only allowed their name to be used on the condition that a hotel license would not be granted for the area. ('Mount Lawley - A Suburban Trail', A Heritage Trails Network Project, Commonwealth/State Bicentennial Project.)

⁷ Copley returned to England in 1914 for an operation and did not return.

member for the Mount Lawley ward of the Perth Roads Board 1908-1926. Robinson also became the MLA for Canning 1914-1921, during which time he held the position of Attorney General, and Minister for Mines, and Woods and Forests.⁸

In 1905-06, Robinson transferred his holdings to his son, Robert Thomson Robinson who, with Copley, formed the Mount Lawley Estate Company to develop the estate as a garden suburb.⁹ The idea of garden suburbs was put forward in 1895, by Ebenezer Howard and promoted by Perth town clerk, W. E. Bold, but it was not taken up generally until the 1930s. The garden suburb movement, based on the belief in environmental determinism and concern that urban living was causing the degeneration of the race, was common in Britain and other industrialised nations.¹⁰ For Mount Lawley this meant that existing bushland would be converted into a model residential estate.

The shape of the Mount Lawley estate was determined by the boundaries of Swan Location Z. With no town planning and a huge demand for building sites during the population boom of the late 1890s and early 1900s, the old land grants were subdivided and sold, 'imprinting their image on the street patterns of inner suburbs'.¹¹

In the early 1900s, the bulk of Mount Lawley's population lived in the vicinity of the railway line. It was the extension of a tramway from Perth to the corner of Walcott and Beaufort Streets in 1906, and the establishment of a railway station in 1907, which led to a housing boom and the development of an upper class area in Mount Lawley.

Reports of building progress in 1913, indicate strong growth in Mt Lawley. Many architectural firms were preparing plans for residences, and homes were also being built privately.

A large number of residences are being erected privately than through the architects' offices. The principal suburbs in which this class of building is in progress are at North Perth and Mt. Lawley.¹²

Suburbs between the City and Midland Junction and also at North Perth and Mt Lawley have received the greatest attention. The trade is brisk in the last named suburbs.¹³

In the Mt Lawley district the advancement has been very marked, and all the residences in that locality are of a good class, many new ones are now in the course of erection and about twelve more are to start immediately.¹⁴

⁸ *Bicentennial Dictionary of Western Australia* Perth, UWA Press, 1988. pp. 661 & 2653.

⁹ Hamilton,., op cit, p. 6; Stannage, C. T. *The People of Perth: A social history of Western Australia's capital city* Perth City Council, 1979, p. 232. In the 1930s, the second and third estates were opened and Mount Lawley continued to develop as an affluent middle-class suburb with large homes and gardens. In 1971, the City of Stirling was created and Mount Lawley became a part of this new local government area.

¹⁰ Freestone, Robert, *Model Cities: The Garden City Movement in Australia*, Thomas Nelson Australia, Melbourne, 1989.

¹¹ Morison, M. P. & White, J. (eds) *Western Towns and Buildings* Perth, UWA Press, 1979. p. 54; Shearwood, G. & O. B., op cit.

¹² *Western Australian Mining, Building and Engineering Journal* 5 April, 1913. p. 5.

¹³ *ibid*, 6 September, 1913. p. 9.

¹⁴ *ibid*, 4 October, 1913. p. 19.

Annesley was one of the earlier homes built in Lawley Crescent. The blocks of land in this section of the estate were originally more than an acre in size, and priced at around £7-£9, but sales were slow and the lots were subsequently further subdivided.¹⁵ *Annesley* was the home of Percival William Armstrong and his wife, Grace Throssell, from 1914 to 1927.¹⁶ All that is known about Armstrong is that he may have been a storekeeper in the Canning area in the late 1880s.¹⁷ The land on which *Annesley* is built, originally two equal sized lots numbered 1150 and 1151, was transferred to Grace Armstrong on 5 June 1913.¹⁸

The Perth Roads Board Metropolitan Sewerage plan of April 1915, shows *Annesley* as one of the largest homes in the area at that time, complete with a garage and driveway, indicating that its owner was progressive as well as wealthy.¹⁹

In 1927, *Annesley* was purchased by company manager, Ernest G. Lumb who occupied the place until 1931, when it was sold to Albert Kaufman, a dental surgeon.²⁰ After Kaufman's death in 1952, *Annesley* was purchased by Charlie Carter and Ida Frances Jones, as joint tenants. Carter, who established the Charlie Carter supermarket chain, is described on the title certificate as an investor.

Under Carter's and Jones' ownership, *Annesley* was converted for use as a C-class hospital, serving the needs of the elderly. The place was known variously as 'Annesley Rest Home' (1953 to 1956), 'Annesley Private Hospital' (1957 to 1980), and 'Annesley Nursing Home' (1980/81).²¹ On the death of Charlie Carter on 29 January 1959, Ida Jones became the sole proprietor of the place until her own death in November 1978, when *Annesley* was transferred to Barry and Richard Jones, both of Sydney.²²

In April 1983, planning approval was obtained for a new subdivision of the land occupied by *Annesley*. Lot 1150, now Lot 2, was increased in size from 1012 sq. metres to 1299 sq. metres, and the size of Lot 1151, now Lot 1, was reduced accordingly to 724 sq. metres.²³ Separate certificates of title were issued for the two new lots.²⁴ *Annesley* now occupies Lot 2 and the garden occupies Lot 1. Both lots were purchased by Coolpark Pty Ltd, in June 1983. It is believed that this company returned *Annesley* to its former residential

¹⁵ Subdivision plans on microfiche, 78c/3, 102c/144 & 103c/171, [pre 1910], from survey firm Crossland & Hardy, Batty Library. A systematic search was made of the *Western Australian Mining, Building and Engineering Journal* and no information could be found about the architect of the building. While it has been suggested that *Annesley* may have been designed by Michael Cavanagh, it is not listed in 'Michael Cavanagh 1860-1941 His Life, His Philosophies [sic] & His Architecture', a thesis by Jane McKenzie.

¹⁶ *Wise's Post Office Directory 1913-1928*.

¹⁷ *Bicentennial Dictionary of Western Australia* Perth, UWA Press, 1988. p. 71.

¹⁸ DOLA Certificate of Title Vol. 555 Fol. 159.

¹⁹ Perth Roads Board Metropolitan Sewerage plan, Sheet No. 118, Revised April 1915.

²⁰ DOLA Certificate of Title, Vol. 555 Fol. 159, op cit; *Wise's Post Office Directory, 1913-1949*.

²¹ *Western Australian Telephone Directory 1952-1982*.

²² DOLA Certificate of Title, Vol. 555 Fol. 159, op cit, Vol. 1466 Fol. 753, Vol. 1543 Fol. 880.

²³ City and Rural Surveys, Diagram 64843.

²⁴ DOLA Certificate of Title, Vol. 1645 Fol. 124 (Lot 1) & 125 (Lot 2).

state before selling to current owners, Stuart and Milanka Scurr, in March 1984.²⁵

The Scurrs had *Annesley* meticulously restored and extended in 1986, under the guidance of architect Michael Lake.²⁶ The front garden is considered to be a good example of the Federation style. It has been awarded the title of 'Best Heritage Garden' by the Mount Lawley Society, an award given every few years based on the opinions of others, in particular real estate agents.²⁷

On 6 May 1997, the City of Stirling approved a two storey dwelling to be constructed on Lot 1, currently occupied by the front garden.²⁸

13.2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

On the west of the junction between Lawley Crescent and Storthes Street is the large single storeyed brick and tile residence, *Annesley*. The Mount Lawley street grid in this area is such that Lawley Crescent runs north-west to south-east and Storthes Street runs south-west to north-east.

Annesley is built in a Federation Queen Anne style, as demonstrated, for example, by the highly ornamented verandahs, tuck pointed brickwork and complex roof shapes.

The owner and resident of *Annesley* was not sympathetic to a detailed inspection of the interior of the place. A brief tour, however, of the interior was permitted and plans of the 1986 additions and alterations forwarded.

The plan of *Annesley* was originally a broad 'L' shape with the long side of the 'L' facing Lawley Crescent. The 1986 extensions were to the two 'L's' of the house, so that the plan shape now is almost square.

The original part of the house appears to have altered little, apart from the demolition of two rooms at the rear, the modern fitting out of the kitchen, the forming of a small cellar below the kitchen and the fitting of antique surrounds and mantelpieces to some of the fireplaces.

The interior layout of *Annesley* is as follows:

The entrance hall addressing Lawley Crescent is at the junction of two wide passages that run parallel to Lawley Crescent and Storthes Street. The two main rooms of the house are located about halfway along each frontage, and these are the large dining room addressing Lawley Crescent and the living room facing Storthes Street. Both these rooms are clearly expressed on the exterior. The gabled dining room steps out in plan to receive the verandahs to each side, and the living room has a large gambrel located over the outside wall. A corner bedroom steps out in plan at 45 degrees, and further articulates the corner by having a corner gambrel. There is a study between the entrance hall and the dining room and at the rear of the house are two small bedrooms and a bathroom. A larger bedroom is situated south-west of the living room.

²⁵ Information supplied by Stuart Scurr to John Loreck.

²⁶ *ibid*; Plans supplied to John Loreck by the owner, Stuart Scurr.

²⁷ Telephone conversation with Ms Lee Cassidy, President, The Mount Lawley Society Inc, 27 October 1997, Memo, HCWA File 8035.

²⁸ Letter from The Mount Lawley Society Inc, HCWA File 8035.

The interior of the original part of the house is of a high quality Federation Queen Anne standard, with decorative skirtings, architraves dados, picture rails and ceilings. The timber floors are either polished or carpeted, according to location.

Annesley is positioned to the south-west of the block leaving extensive front gardens and a small backyard. The front garden of *Annesley* is highly landscaped and is bordered by a limestone wall about one metre high with one to one and a half metre high piers about every four to five metres. On top of the wall and piers is a cement coping. The width of the piers is such that the coping of the walls butt neatly into the piers. In the front wall are set a number of wrought iron gates - a double gate at right angles to the street near the driveway, and a single gate facing the Lawley Crescent near the front door. The wall at this point steps back in plan in a right angled 'U' shape. On the street side of the limestone wall to both frontages is a landscaping zone about 600mm wide beyond which is a footpath. On the corner, the wall is truncated for a length of about eight metres. On the street side of the truncated wall, on the bisecting axis of the wall and the street junction is a mature eucalypt. The landscaping on the corner is more extensive than typically. Within the garden beyond the limestone walls are a large number of bangalow and cotton palms, also a trampoline and a fountain. All of the landscape elements are recent.

The Lawley Crescent side of the entry steps has a wall which curves so that the lower step is widest and the top step is narrowest. The top of the curved wall is typically about 300mm above the step nosing and terminates at the base with a short pier on which is a decorative vase with flowers.

The steps are contained on the opposite side of the low curved wall by a rock faced limestone foundation wall about one and a half metres high which is continuous under the verandah on the Lawley Crescent frontage, but not on the Storthes Street frontage where only foundation piers occur. A continuous timber fascia with a double bullnose moulding fascia serves to terminate the timber floorboards and joists of the verandah.

Directly over the fascia is a highly decorative timber balustrade painted white, which consists of about eight to twelve balustrades, depending on the spacing of the verandah posts. The balustrades are turned so that they are typically square in section but articulated at the top, middle and bottom with three circular bosses of a diameter less than the dimension of the square.

At the top and spanning between the balusters is an arched timber panel, which is directly under the timber handrail, and runs between the coupled verandah posts. The coupled verandah posts are set apart at an interval of two baluster bays. Directly against each verandah post is a split half baluster. The junction between half baluster and verandah post is a little awkward as the mouldings of the baluster do not match comfortably with the moulding of the verandah posts.

Typically, each verandah post has a square base and an elaborately turned shaft and square capital. The capital serves as the springing point for the valance. The valance consists of two decorative beams, one above the other and about 200mm apart. Originally, spindles at intervals identically matching those of the balusters linked the two valance beams, but these are missing on the main front verandah, and are present only on the kitchen verandah

valance. The lower valance beam is of a depth to form a semicircular arch between coupled verandah posts. A flat arch with an identical springing point and head height spans between each pair of coupled posts.

The height of all capitals to the verandah posts are determined by the semicircular arch to the lower valance beam that spans between the coupled verandah posts. Between each pair of coupled posts the lower valance beam has a flat arch identical in depth to the semicircular arch.

Each spandrel of the lower valance beam is highlighted by a small hole, one to each side of the verandah post. The top of the lower valance beam steps out in section, like a small cornice and the cornice steps around the verandah post. This cornice detail is the only continuous horizontal element of the verandah, apart from the gutter and the fascia below it. The tops of the verandah posts terminate into the fascia, which is quite deep in plan, about the same width as the verandah post capitals at the lower valance springing height.

The verandah elements of the balustrade, posts and valances are finely considered and the balance of horizontals and verticals adroitly handled. The use of the deep valance works well to separate and articulate the oblique roof plane from the vertical verandah plane. This articulation is further emphasised by the painting of the verandah timbers white and the gutter green to match the verandah floor fascia below.

The soffit of the verandah is raked, to match the roof pitch of about thirty degrees and lined with pressed metal, which appears original.

In 1986, extensions were added. A large double garage was added to the Storthes Street frontage, with a large bedroom and two bathrooms at the rear. At the rear of the kitchen a laundry and family room were added. As a result of these two extensions there is no back 'yard'. In its place are a brick paved courtyard and a swimming pool in the back corner. The overall affect from the rear courtyard is that the house is too large for the block. The extensions are generally in keeping with the original, with the new windows and doors and roof tiles matching the originals closely.

The modern bricks do not match the format of the original. However the junctions between the old and new brickwork are minimised. At the rear for example, the original exterior leaf of brickwork between the two extensions has been removed and replaced with modern brickwork.

The roof forms of the extension are similar to the original. However the small gambrels at the rear of the house are clad in fibrous cement rather than the timber battens of the original small gambrels. Internally the extensions are in keeping with the original intentions, with similar sill head and ceiling heights, and particular attention has been paid to closely matching the original timber windows and doors. The main difference is the use of concrete, rather than timber, for the floors.

13.3 REFERENCES

No key references.

13.4 FURTHER RESEARCH
