



REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES- ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in September, 1991 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE

11.2. HISTORIC VALUE

Butterly House is believed to be the earliest example of a dwelling with Flemish bond brickwork in Toodyay. (Criterion 2.2)

Butterly House has a close association with the Mongers, one of the first European families to settle the Avon valley. The place also has a close association with the Butterly family, long time occupants of the place, after which it is now named. (Criterion 2.3)

11.3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

11.4. SOCIAL VALUE

Butterly House is important to the Toodyay community's sense of history and place. It is a reminder of the European settlement of the region. (Criterion 4.2)

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12.1. RARITY

12.2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

Butterly House is representative of 1870s farming accommodation. The building incorporates, in its fabric, upgrading of the dwelling in response to changing economic circumstances over time. (Criterion 6.2)

12.3 CONDITION

A program of restoration is in place. *Butterly House* is in sound condition.

12. 4 INTEGRITY

Extensive modifications were made to the building fabric during remodelling that was carried out in 1910. However, the building has been used for purposes similar to that for which it was built and the original intention of a residence remains intact.

Butterly House has a moderate degree of integrity.

12. 5 AUTHENTICITY

Due to the extensive remodelling that occurred in 1910, the fabric of the building has changed considerably from that of the original c. 1870 dwelling. However, the changes to the fabric can be seen as demonstrating the evolution of usage of the building.

Butterly House has a moderate degree of authenticity.

13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

13. 1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

Butterly House is a single-storey, brick and iron building constructed in Toodyay, circa 1870, as the family home for the Monger family.

Toodyay was originally a small village on the bend of the Avon River, near the West Toodyay Bridge.³² The town flourished briefly during the 1850s; however, it was plagued by floodwaters and Toodyay's decline began when a new town of Newcastle was gazetted in 1861, about 3km upstream. The new town was located around the site of the convict depot, where a number of comparatively substantial buildings had already been erected. Newcastle's name was changed to Toodyay, in 1911, following confusion with Newcastle in NSW.³³

The construction date of *Butterly House* is circa 1870, and the original ownership is attributed to J. H. Monger.³⁴ Several branches of the Monger family, who dominated York business, had moved to Toodyay in the 1860s. John Henry Monger Jnr., bought Lot 1, by the bridge, and a portion of Charles Harper's land which was adjacent. There he built a two-storey warehouse and store with outbuildings. He sold it soon afterwards to his father, J. H. Monger Snr. for £550. Another son, Charles Samuel Monger was installed as storekeeper of the business.³⁵ It was while he was in charge of the family store, that he occupied *Butterly House*.

Butterly House has an association with the Western Australian Bank. An extract from the minutes of a board meeting of the Bank, dated 25 October,

³² Old Toodyay is now referred to as West Toodyay.

³³ Erickson, R., *Old Toodyay and Newcastle*, (Toodyay Shire Council, 1974), p. xii.

³⁴ Chitty, I. D., 'Toodyay: A Survey of Historical Buildings', (for the Toodyay Shire Council, 1975). It should be noted that at the time, there were three men with the initials J. H. Monger; namely J. H. Monger Jnr., J. H. Monger Snr., and also another J. H. Monger.

³⁵ Erickson, p. 167.

1889, shows that a decision was made to open a branch at Newcastle.³⁶ At a further meeting it was minuted that:

The agreement made by the chairman with Mr C.T. Monger (sic) for premises (at Newcastle) was read - terms for renting, Newcastle Town Lot 11 (upon which is erected a six room cottage) for one year, with right of renewal for another, yearly rent 50 pounds with the right of purchase during that term for 1000 pounds.³⁷

This was the prelude to the opening of the branch at Newcastle on 30 November 1889. It involved a doorway being cut into the east wall of *Butterly House* for bank use.

In circa 1897-99 the bank vacated the premises and Mr Monger resumed occupancy. Mr Monger had a sign painted on the brick wall, some of which is still faintly visible today.

Around 1910, the place was acquired by Mr and Mrs Butterly (nee Monger). In 1910, they commissioned a relative, Harry Davey, of Toodyay, to carry out the extensive remodelling of *Butterly House*. The back rooms were rough patched, a new main roof was erected, gables were levelled, a verandah was installed all round, the back wall and skillion roof were raised, the kitchen/passage wall was demolished, the window from the back bedroom to the kitchen was replaced with french doors, plaster was applied to four rooms plus the passage, fireplace surrounds and passage archways were installed, brick steps to front were built, stamped metal ceilings to kitchen and servant's room were installed, and trellis work and a picket fence were erected.³⁸

In essence, the house was completely remodelled and changed. According to local knowledge, Mr Butterly was not happy with the original style of the house and the end result was almost a copy of the Butterly property at Bolgart. *Butterly House* was occupied by the Butterly family until 1980, when the place was sold to the Shire of Toodyay. In March 1981, Toodyay Shire Council leased *Butterly House* to the Toodyay Homes for the Aged Association (now Butterly Cottages Association (Inc.)).

Butterly House remained unoccupied and neglected until 1990, when volunteers began working on the building to halt its decay.

In consultation with the Heritage Council of Western Australia, it was agreed that circa 1930 was the most appropriate time period on which to base a restoration. Restoration prior to the 1910 remodelling involved changes that were too extensive.³⁹

In January 1995, *Butterly House* is still being restored and it is intended that the building will be used as an 'autumn club' for the people living in the adjacent Butterly Cottages Association Aged Persons Units.⁴⁰

³⁶ *Central Districts Herald Tribune*, 10 December 1964, p. 16.

³⁷ *ibid.*

³⁸ Taylor, J., 'Report on Butterly House/Formerly Monger's Cottage', (for HCWA, June 1992).

³⁹ Telephone conversation with Mr Jack Hammer, who has undertaken the direction of the restoration work completed so far. (08.12.1992)

⁴⁰ Telephone conversation with Mr Robert Millar, Shire Clerk of Toodyay, (Memo, HCWA P3253, 05/01/1995).

13. 2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Butterly House is a single-storey brick and iron residence built in Victorian Georgian style.⁴¹

According to a survey undertaken in the 1970s by Ian Chitty on historic buildings in Toodyay, *Butterly House* was broadly categorised in the 'Newcastle group', although in the sub-group sections it does not fall within a particular section and is therefore classed as 'ungrouped Newcastle'.⁴²

The four main rooms and front part of the passage have stamped metal ceilings. The two back rooms and passage have exposed rafters and shingles. The two back rooms are rough plastered, while the four main rooms and front end of the passage are raw brickwork.⁴³

The brickwork of the 'front', or east facing wall, under the original verandah, is of Flemish bond construction. According the survey undertaken by Chitty, the Flemish bond brickwork is the earliest example of that form of bond in Newcastle or Old Toodyay.⁴⁴ The remainder of the brickwork is English bond. All walls appear to be solid 9 inch walls. The chimneys under the front rooms, visible from the cellar area, are constructed of local stone mortared together between brick quoins. The external faces of the brickwork to three sides have been tuck-pointed during the circa 1910 modifications, and this illustrates the bondings used.

There is a toilet, approximately 15m to the rear of the building. The original shingled roof is partially intact, and it is of brick construction in English bond. There is a conservation plan for the place.

In the interior, the original joinery is still intact with wooden mantles and pressed metal ceilings. The kitchen retains an original wood stove.⁴⁵

A restoration plan to restore *Butterly House* to the c. 1930 period, based on John Taylor's report written in 1992, recommended the removal or camouflage of the silver paint on the chimneys and top of wall, restoration of the roof, complete replacement of the gutters on two levels, painting of all guttering and woodwork in keeping with the 1930s theme and the replacement of the verandah floors.

13. 3 REFERENCES

Taylor, J., 'Report on Butterly House/Formerly Monger's Cottage', (June 1992).

National Trust Assessment Exposition, September 1991.

41 Apperly, R., Irving, R., Reynolds, P. *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture. Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*. (Angus and Robertson, North Ryde, 1989), pp. 42-45.

42 Chitty.

43 Unless otherwise stated, the information presented in the Physical Evidence section is taken from: Taylor, J., 'Report on Butterly House/Formerly Monger's Cottage', (for HCWA, June 1992).

44 Chitty, no pagination.

45 *Trust News*, 177th edition, April 1992, p. 11.