



REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES - ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE

Pine Lodge is a finely designed and executed substantial single storey residence in the Federation Queen Anne style, set in expansive grounds. (Criterion 1.1)

The place's architecture embodies skilled carpentry and sensitive design in the verandah valances, the eaves brackets, the window and door joinery, the delicacy of the balustrades and columns of the rotunda and the ranging horizontality of the building form. (Criterion 1.2)

The dense planting of mature Norfolk Island pine trees, which grow in the gardens and border each side of John Street for its entire length, form a landmark which can be seen from many points in the surrounding suburbs and from far out to sea. (Criterion 1.3)

11.2. HISTORIC VALUE

Pine Lodge is representative of the residential development of the Peppermint Grove, Cottesloe and Swanbourne areas, in particular the establishment of large family homes and grounds following the increase in population and prosperity associated with the gold discoveries of the 1890s. (Criterion 2.2)

Pine Lodge was designed by eminent architect Edwin Summerhayes for William Zimpel, a prominent furniture merchant and manufacturer whose business operated in Hay Street, Perth, from the 1880s to the 1960s. (Criterion 2.3)

11.3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

11.4. SOCIAL VALUE

Pine Lodge is highly valued by both the local and wider community for its landmark setting amongst a dense planting of mature Norfolk Island Pines. This setting is a well-known feature of the suburb of Cottesloe and contributes to this community's sense of place. (Criteria 4.1 & 4.2)

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12.1. RARITY

12.2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

Pine Lodge is representative of a number of substantial residences built in the seaside suburbs of Perth and in country area in the early years of the twentieth century. (Criterion 6.1)

The pine trees in the grounds of *Pine Lodge* and the associated pines in John Street are representative of the garden suburb movement of the early twentieth century, when the Forestry Department provided a variety of seedlings free of charge for planting in public spaces. (Criterion 6.2)

12.3 CONDITION

The condition of the place is good.

12.4 INTEGRITY

The place has a high degree of integrity. The original intention of the design is intact, in that the building is used as a single residence.

12.5 AUTHENTICITY

The place has a moderate degree of authenticity. The street facade is intact. Internal changes and additions at the rear, while altering the nature of the building, have been kept in the character of the original design.

13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The documentary evidence was compiled by Jacqui Sherriff, Historian, Heritage Council of Western Australia staff. The physical evidence was compiled from information in the Municipal Inventory by Dorothy Erickson of Erickson & Taylor, Art Historian and Designer. Both the documentary and physical evidence incorporate earlier work undertaken by John Pidgeon Architect (1997).

13.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

Pine Lodge was built in 1909 for prominent furniture manufacturer and importer, William Zimpel, and his family. The place was designed by Edwin Summerhayes to replace an earlier residence and has been known as 'Pine Lodge' since its construction.

In the 1830s, the area now known as Cottesloe was known as Buckland Downs. Trig surveys of the area were undertaken by John Septimus Roe in 1839 and 1850. In the early days of the Swan River Colony, the Cottesloe area was sparsely settled. Two sandy tracks ran through the sandy soil from Fremantle and converged at the Halfway House, or Butler's Inn¹, which was situated in the vicinity of the present-day Albion Hotel, before continuing to Perth. In 1860, convict labour commenced the construction of the Perth-Fremantle Road, and in 1864, the first Fremantle traffic bridge was completed. The completion of the second bridge in 1867 substantially

¹ The Inn is mentioned in correspondence as early as 1837.

increased the volume of traffic on the route and in 1872 the toll road was declared a public highway. At this time, there was sparse settlement in the area, comprised mainly of limeburners, quarrymen and goat herders. In the 1870s, much of the land was set aside as a public amenity, setting the course for Cottesloe as a seaside resort.²

The Perth-Fremantle Railway was completed in 1881 and stations were constructed at Cottesloe and Cottesloe Beach, making the area more accessible as a holiday resort. However, the area was not surveyed until 1883, when John Forrest, Commissioner of Crown Lands and Surveyor General, undertook the task. Forrest personally supervised the laying out of the streets and set aside ample reserves which were secured by an Act of Parliament.³ The area was named Cottesloe three years later and became a Roads Board District in 1895.⁴

Following the gold discoveries of the early 1890s and the associated increase in population and general prosperity, Cottesloe also began to be developed as a residential suburb. As typhoid became a problem in Perth due to overcrowding and lack of sanitary facilities, Cottesloe, Claremont and the area that later became Swanbourne were valued for their healthy sea breezes and close proximity to both the Indian Ocean and the Swan River. In South Cottesloe, large houses such as Banksia (now Le Fanu) was built for the Holmes family in 1892-7 and South Sea, Timaru and Rockton (Nos 64 to 68 Forrest Street) were built as rental properties. By 1893, there were 23 people living permanently in Cottesloe/Peppermint Grove, including T J Briggs, lime merchant, Septimus Burt, Attorney General, Miss Cowan, teacher, J C Foulkes, gentleman MP, H D Holmes, head of the Western Australian Bank, C Mole, stonemason and F A Moseley, Registrar of the Supreme Court.⁵ Cottesloe was also attractive as a seaside resort and a number of summer residences were built by prominent Perth families, including the Burts who built Tukurura in South Cottesloe between 1896 and 1901.

In May 1891, Roger Norman, dentist, and Daniel Kenney, surgeon, purchased Suburban Lot 47 and other land in the present-day John Street area, primarily for investment purposes. They had the land surveyed for subdivision and began selling the lots.⁶

In June 1901, Frances Nellie Zimpel, wife of Perth furniture merchant, William Zimpel purchased Lots 28, 29 and 30 (part of Lot 47) on the north side of John Street from Norman.⁷

² Erickson & Taylor, 'Municipal Inventory Town of Cottesloe', 1995, pp. 7-10; Ruth Marchant James, *Heritage of Pines*, Vanguard Service Press, Perth, 1977, pp. 10-12.

³ Lang, Jean, 'The Cottesloe Story', unpublished manuscript in the possession of the author, p. 21. John, Forrest, Margaret and Hamersley streets were named for John Forrest and his wife, Margaret.

⁴ Erickson & Taylor, op. cit., p. 7.

⁵ *Post Office Directory*. 1893.

⁶ Certificate of Title, Volume 35 Folio 368, 18 May 1891. Ownership of Lots 28, 29 & 30 were transferred to the sole ownership of Roger Norman in 1891 and 1892. See Certificate of Title Volume 44 Folio 389 and Volume 38 Folio 33. The oldest house still standing west of the railway line is reputed to be that built for Norman on Lot 47, now no. 47 John Street. According to quarryman and former Mayor of Claremont, T J Briggs, Norman owned one of the first two houses on the ocean side of Cottesloe. The other was in South Cottesloe. See Briggs, T J, *Life and Experiences of A Successful West Australian*, Sand and MacDougal, Perth, 1917, p. 125.

⁷ Certificate of Title, Volume 44 Folio 389; Certificate of Title, Volume 38 Folio 33, 4 June 1901.

William Zimpel was born in Austria and worked extensively in Constantinople, Turkey, and London before coming to Western Australia in the early 1880s.⁸ He is reputed to have been one of a hundred craftsmen brought out to work for Smith & Co., a furniture manufacturing business managed by James Grave.⁹

In 1884, William Zimpel set up business as a cabinetmaker with a Mr. Schwartz.¹⁰ By 1888, he had established his own factory and showrooms at 797-801 Hay Street, Perth, which continued in business until the 1960s.¹¹ In 1895, Zimpel advertised that he was importing bicycles regularly and that he had recently introduced the first lady's bike to the colony.¹²

The Zimpel catalogue of c. 1900 lists a number of items manufactured by Zimpel, including drawing, dining and bed room furniture, library, office and kitchen furniture, venetian blinds, wire stretchers and mattresses, 'perambulators and go-carts', as well as 'fenders and bedsteads in great variety'. Imports included American and Venetian chairs, crockery and cutlery, Genoa velvets, tapestries and plushes, as well as curtains, blankets, quilts and sheeting.¹³ Zimpel built up a reputation of being able to supply everything needed to furnish either a simple cottage or a large home. He also carried out Government contracts and started a country order department.¹⁴

Zimpel married Frances Nellie Harland, daughter of surveyor George Harland, on 3 February 1886. They initially lived above the business in Hay Street, where five of their eight children were born.¹⁵ At the time of concern over typhoid c. 1898, the Zimpels moved to Cottesloe.¹⁶ It is claimed that they initially lived in a cottage owned by Norman on the southern side of John Street.¹⁷ By 1903, they were living on the northern side of the street, where *Pine Lodge* now stands after, presumably, having a residence built following their purchase of the land in June 1901.¹⁸

-
- ⁸ J S Battye, *Cyclopedia of Western Australia*, volume I, Cyclopedia Company, Perth, 1912, p. 736; R Erickson, *Bicentennial Dictionary of Western Australians, pre-1829-1888*, volume IV, UWA Press, Nedlands, 1988, p. 3419 cites Zimpel's year of arrival as 1884.
- ⁹ James, op. cit., p. 106. James mistakenly claims that the enterprise was the Federal Furniture Factory. Smith & Co. exhibited fine furniture in Joubert and Twopenny's 1881 Perth International Exhibition and in 1884, the company was purchased by the Western Australian Manufacturing Co., an enterprise associated with Maitland Brown, Alexander Forrest and R F Sholl. See Peter Cowan, *Maitland Brown*, FAC Press, Perth, 1988, pp. 344-5.
- ¹⁰ *The Herald WA Almanac and Commercial Directory*, 1885, p. x.
- ¹¹ *The West Australian*, 1 June 1888, p. 3. The showroom and factory was destroyed by fire in 1897; its replacement was designed by H S Trigg. See *Western Mail*, Christmas Number, 1898.
- ¹² *The West Australian*, 5 September 1895, p. 5. For further information about Zimpel's business, see *Twentieth Century Impressions of Western Australia*, P W H Thiel, Perth, 1901, pp. 446-8.
- ¹³ *W Zimpel's Catalogue of Furniture*, c. 1900.
- ¹⁴ Battye, op. cit., p. 726.
- ¹⁵ James, op. cit., p. 107.
- ¹⁶ *Wise's Post Office Directory*, 1898. Previous listings for William Zimpel list his address as Hay Street, Perth.
- ¹⁷ James, op. cit., p. 106. Other reports claim that they initially lived on the east side of the railway, although this is not confirmed by the Post Office directory listings for William Zimpel. Norman's House, at 47 John Street, opposite *Pine Lodge*, still stands.
- ¹⁸ *Wise's Post Office Directory*, 1903, p. 59. As this is the first year that listings are divided into street blocks, it can not be determined when the Zimpels moved to the northern side of the street. Cottesloe Roads Board Minutes and Rate Books from this period are no longer extant.

From 1903 the distinctive Norfolk Island Pines supplied by the Forestry Department were planted as street trees. In 1904, a pier was constructed at the end of Forrest Street, increasing the attractions of the area.

In January 1909, Zimpel engaged architect Edwin Summerhayes to design 'extensive additions' to his residence at Cottesloe.¹⁹ Summerhayes had arrived in Western Australia from Victoria c. 1894, and was initially based in Coolgardie. By 1898, he had designed the Coolgardie Turkish Baths, Jewish Synagogue, Presbyterian Church, the Mechanics Institute and was working on the Coolgardie Exhibition Building. In 1903, Summerhayes established his own practice in Perth and became well known for this 'comfortable homesteads and villas [which] abound in all parts of Western Australia' (including Katanning, Broomehill, Claremont, and Mount Lawley).²⁰ Summerhayes was a foundation member of the Western Australian Institute of Architects in 1896 and was a Major in the volunteer forces, as well as a councillor for Claremont c. 1904.²¹

The tenders for the additions to the Zimpel residence were postponed in February 1909, as 'plans [were] on the boards for a new building'.²² On 20 February, Summerhayes advertised for tenders for 'the erection of a residence at Cottesloe for Mr Zimpel, in accordance with the plans and specifications to be inspected at my offices'.²³ C E Turnville's bid of £1,079/15/4 was accepted the following month.²⁴ Construction was completed by the following year, when the Zimpel residence in John Street, Cottesloe, was listed in the postal directory as 'Pine Lodge'.²⁵

The large house had 'five bedrooms, a maids room, spacious drawing and dining room, a large ballroom plus the usual cellar and work areas. The fine carved mantelpieces in some of the rooms were created in Zimpel's own factory'.²⁶ Stables and an extensive vegetable garden and orchard containing 'figs, grapes, pears, apricots, mulberries, almonds and loquats' were also established.²⁷ In the 1940s, the garden still had a sunny aspect, which it no longer has.²⁸

Over the years, there has been some debate over the origin of the pine trees in John Street and their association with *Pine Lodge*. It appears that the pine trees inside the *Pine Lodge* grounds were planted before the street trees and predate the construction of *Pine Lodge*. An historic photograph (dated c. 1914) shows the pine trees inside the house lot to be considerably taller than the street trees, which are protected by picket guards.²⁹ The street pine trees, which have grown to become a well-known land mark and are shown on admiralty charts as landfalls, were apparently planted by the Cottesloe Roads Board at the request and motion of Councillor William Zimpel c. 1903. Also

19 *WA Mining Building and Engineering Journal; Construction and Engineering News*, 23 January 1909, p. 1.

20 Battye, op. cit., p. 625.

21 Kelly, I, 'Architectural Biography 1890-1915: a brief biographical list of architects who practiced in Western Australia in the years 1890 to 1915', prepared as part of Master of Architecture Thesis, UWA, 1991; Dorothy Erickson, pers. comm., 20 March 2000.

22 *WA Mining Building and Engineering Journal*, 13 February 1909, p. 19.

23 *WA Mining Building and Engineering Journal*, 20 February 1909, p. 23.

24 *WA Mining Building and Engineering Journal*, 20 March 1909, p. 20.

25 *Wise's Post Office Directory*, 1910, p. 75.

26 James, op. cit., p. 107.

27 *ibid.*

28 Dorothy Erickson, pers. com., 20 March 2000.

29 The photograph is reproduced in *Subiaco Post*, 26-27 June 1999, p. 1. See also p. 54.

involved in the scheme was John Doscas, a fellow member of the Roads Board.³⁰

At the time, local governments were concerned with establishing garden suburbs with suitable parks and gardens for public recreation. In 1903, the Government, possibly urged by Perth Town Clerk, William Bold, made a decided effort to green the suburbs of Perth. Accordingly, the Forestry Department prepared thousands of seedlings at their Hamel Nursery and provided them free to municipalities to plant as street trees. The various councils and individual only needed to apply for the seedlings, as there was no cost involved. Leederville and other suburbs, as well as a number of country towns, were planted at the same time.³¹

Pine Lodge remained in the Zimpel family until 1976³², when it was purchased by Con and Janice Somas.³³ In November 1980, the place was purchased by Rombe Pty Ltd, thought to be a Wise family company.³⁴ The most recent change of ownership of *Pine Lodge* was in 1988, when it was transferred to Sandra Wise, as Woopine Pty Ltd.³⁵

Pine Lodge has undergone two renovation programmes. The first was c.1980, when the Somas' added Georgian style windows to the ballroom's north wall, renovated the kitchen, built the red brick garden and courtyard walls to the west and north, and installed a swimming pool to the north.³⁶

Following the purchase by the Wise family in 1980, the kitchen, cellars, east wing and swimming pool were extensively remodelled to designs by Dorothy Erickson with structural engineering by Perry Leach. During this renovation phase, a Georgian style windows (designed to harmonise with the adjacent ballroom) were added to the north and east of the new and enlarged French provincial kitchen, while new skirtings and cornices were created to match the existing. A stair was inserted to the cellar. The dining room fire surround/fireplace (which was made in Zimpel's factory) was relocated to the ballroom where a new fireplace was constructed. A locally purchased antique surround was installed in the dining room. Adaptations to the east wing provided three bedroom/sitting rooms, two bathrooms, a powder room, guests' pantry, sun room and conservatory/pool room. The former library was converted to a bathroom and walk-in robe. The stained glass windows and doors in the new pool room were sourced from the demolished National Mutual House, while the parquet floor, a copy of Thomas Jefferson's, was imported from America. A verandah was added to the rear portion of the east wing and the stairs to the belvedere, which had been missing for some years, were replaced. The cellar was enlarged at this time and underground garages built adjacent. A few years later, the stables and remains of the

³⁰ *Civic Centre News*, September 1957, p. 1; R Erickson, op. cit., pp. 107-108; Subiaco Post, 26-27 June 1999, pp. 1, 54.

³¹ Dorothy Erickson in Kelly Aris Architect, 'Perth Oval Conservation Plan', 1999, p. 15. For example, the Municipality of Cue Council planted pepper tree seedlings obtained from the Forestry Department in Austin and Darlot streets c. 1900.

³² Following Mrs Frances Zimpel's death in 1958 ownership was transferred to three of the Zimpel children – Frances, Winifred and Dorothy. Certificate of Title, Volume 1045 Folio 256, 6 October 1949.

³³ Certificate of Title, Volume 1195 Folio 124, 21 April 1976.

³⁴ Certificate of Title Volume 1195 Folio 124, 11 November 1980.

³⁵ Certificate of Title Volume 1195 Folio 124, 23 May 1988.

³⁶ Dorothy Erickson, pers. comm., 20 March 2000.

orchard were demolished to make way for a tennis court.³⁷ The north garden was designed in 1980 with a latticed courtyard to provide privacy around the swimming pool. The east garden was planted at a later date after the tennis court was built. In the early 1990s, the east wing was renovated as a guest wing and a guest pantry was constructed in the sauna room (the sauna had never been installed).³⁸

In March 2000, *Pine Lodge* is rented by a local mining entrepreneur and is under consideration for purchase.

13.2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Pine Lodge, a sprawling single storey, red brick and iron bungalow in the Federation style, is set in spacious grounds covering three residential lots.

The grounds are almost completely ringed by mature Norfolk Island Pines. The John Street street planing, also Norfolk Island Pines, provide a dense shade to the front garden. The shade is so dense that, together with the weight of fallen needles, garden plants under the pines have difficulty thriving. No lawn survives on the verge. Plantings in the front garden are close together on the south east in an attempt to provide a windbreak. The garden is brick paved for much of this area (1980s) in an attempt to cope with the problems associated with the Pine Trees and to make it attractive.

The front, or south aspect of the place is contained by a fence of wrought iron on a low brick base with brick piers. These have been rendered and painted. The west side of the property is contained by a rather obtrusive clinker brick wall which extends with screen walls to form a paved kitchen courtyard. The northern wall, which is rendered, serves as a retainer for the swimming pool and encloses pool equipment. Both the west and north walls have suffered structural damage from the pine trees which abut sections.

The eastern boundary is contained by a wire-lock tennis court fence. The tennis court has an artificial surface. Attractive roses and other garden beds contained by limestone walls dating from the 1980s, are adjacent to the tennis court, which is set at a lower level. The northern garden surrounds the pool and consists of narrow beds with herbs, roses and climbers over lattice and plants in large urns. This garden also dates from the 1980s.

The house is constructed in a U-shape with red brick walls, tuckpointed to the major facades of the original elevations, with a corrugated iron roof. It is single-storyed with wide timber verandahs, turned timber pillars and a candle-snuffer roofed octagonal, roof level, rotunda at the south-west corner of the house, expressed at ground floor level as a corner bay window to the Sitting or Drawing Room.

The main rooms have large double-hung windows opening onto the verandahs. The front door has leaded stained glass panels and side lights. The portions of the house in original condition are the south façade, and the southern section of the west façade and east façade. There is an original leaded stained glass panelled door to the southern portion of the east façade. The east wing has been added and extended north in a manner sympathetic to the original.

³⁷ Dorothy Erickson, correspondence to Australian Heritage Commission, dated March 1994 on HCWA File P3682; Dorothy Erickson, pers. comm., 20 March 2000.

³⁸ Dorothy Erickson, pers. comm., 20 March 2000.

On entering the house, there is a hallway paved with marble (1970s), with a wrought iron feature gate inserted in the arch to the ballroom. The drawing room to the west is original. This has a fine timber fire surround carved with swans and made in the Zimpel factory. To the north of this and accessed via the ballroom, is a dining room with bay window. The room can accommodate a table seating fourteen and a second table seating six to eight. The fireplace is not original.

North of the dining room is the original scullery and pantry. The door into the dining room was inserted in the 1980s. The shells of the pantry cupboards are original. The laundry section was put in place in the 1980s, at the same time as the stairs to the cellar. The kitchen was enlarged to the west by about a metre in the 1980s, bringing it into alignment with the dining room walls. French doors with fanlights open onto the paved pool area to the east and a fixed window, also with fan light, overlooks the pool to the north. The west wall has a double hung Edwardian style window. Beneath the kitchen and paved pool courtyard are a cellar and double garage which date from the 1980s.

The Ballroom is a central space, with fourteen-foot ceilings. The windows to the north are not original and were inserted in the 1970s, making the room much lighter than previously. The east wall of this room has only a few items of original fabric remaining. The original doorways to the bathroom and bedroom have been bricked up and a fireplace inserted in a central position on the east wall.

The former library, to the south of the ballroom, was converted to a bathroom and walk-in robe following the bricking up of the door leading from the ballroom. Beside the master bedroom on the south side of the house is a study in original configuration. Changed light fittings, additional electrical outlets and shutters to this and the bay windows of the master bedroom are the only additions to this part of the house.

The portion of the house lying east of the ballroom has been extended to the north and east. This portion of the house now comprises two bathrooms, powder room, guests' pantry, a passageway under the original roof and additional three bedroom/sitting rooms, sun room and conservatory/pool room. In the poolroom, new (recycled) stained glass windows and doors were incorporated, and open onto a paved garden containing a pergola and swimming floor. The parquet floor of the poolroom was imported from the United States of America.

13.3 COMPARATIVE INFORMATION

Residences of a similar scale to *Pine Lodge* in the Cottesloe area include the two-storey Tukurura (Burt's Summer Residence; 1896-1901) and Donard Lodge (1898). Single storey houses or bungalows in the Federation Queen Anne style include Banksia, (1892-97; later known as Le Fanu) and Glencairn 36 Broome Street (1896). In the more austere Federation style, and more comparable to *Pine Lodge*, are Belvedere at 12 Rosendo Street, built for the Campbells in 1906, Montfiore at 53 John Street, built in 1913 and which has many similarities to *Pine Lodge*, and Westward Ho at 45 Broome Street, built in 1910/2 for Annie Rossiter. None of these houses are as grand as *Pine Lodge*. There is a group of bungalows at 3 to 15 Congdon Street, built between 1903 and 1915 on Claremont Hill. No. 5 and No. 11 are the largest of these residences, and only No. 11 (Tremora) has the possibility of containing a ballroom. Of all these residences, only *Pine Lodge*, Tukurura and Belvedere sit

in spacious grounds, and the latter two are under pressure from development closing in.

Outside the district, some of the houses along the foreshore at Peppermint Grove and a number in Mount Lawley, such as 20 and 22 Almondbury Street, 56 and 58 Queens Crescent and 49 Lawley Crescent, as well as some on 'Knob Hill', Preston Point Road, East Fremantle, are comparable examples of fine residences dating from the same period.

Probably the closest residences in comparison to *Pine Lodge* are the grand country farmhouses in the plainer Edwardian style in the Great Southern district. These include Cubbine, Cunderdin, Wallinar, Kattanning, Hounsome, Moojebing and Wedderburn Park, Brunswick. Several of these and similar houses were designed by Summerhayes who was a prominent architect in the area. Many of these farmhouses are illustrated in Battye's *Cyclopedia of Western Australia* (1913) and *Twentieth Century Impressions* (1901) and the majority of them still stand.

13. 4 REFERENCES

No key references.

13. 5 FURTHER RESEARCH
