



REGISTER OF HERITAGE PLACES - ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

11. ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The criteria adopted by the Heritage Council in November 1996 have been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

PRINCIPAL AUSTRALIAN HISTORIC THEME(S)

- 8.9 Commemorating significant events and people

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA THEME(S)

- 606 Famous & infamous people

11.1 AESTHETIC VALUE*

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough has aesthetic value as a unique monument of glazed stoneware construction, which is of particular interest for its elaborate and creative design. (Criterion 1.1)

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is an interesting and unique landmark situated near the corner of Market Street and Elder Place. (Criterion 1.3)

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough contributes to the precinct at the north end of Market Street formed by the Post Office Building, the Railway Station, the Pumping Station and Pioneer Park. (Criterion 1.4)

11.2. HISTORIC VALUE

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is believed to have been constructed by well-known stoneware manufacturers, Doulton and Company in Lambeth, London. (Criterion 2.2)

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough was constructed in 1905 in memory of John Taylor's two sons, Ernest Baines Taylor who died aged 21 years on 18 September 1885, and Peter Southern Taylor who also died aged 21 years on 19 March 1890. (Criterion 2.3)

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is associated with ship owner John Taylor, a ship owner with the London firm Bethell and Company, who established business interests in Western Australia. (Criterion 2.3)

* For consistency, all references to architectural style are taken from Apperly, Richard; Irving, Robert and Reynolds, Peter *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus & Robertson, North Ryde, 1989.

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is a unique and elaborate monument of glazed stoneware construction, which is of creative design combining a drinking fountain with water troughs for horses and, cats and dogs. (Criterion 2.4)

11. 3. SCIENTIFIC VALUE

11. 4. SOCIAL VALUE

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough has social significance to the Fremantle and wider community as an interesting and unique landmark. Its value to the community is indicated by its classification by the National Trust of Australia (WA Branch), its inclusion in the City of Fremantle Municipal Inventory, its listing in the Register of Heritage Places, and its listing in the Register of the National Estate. (Criteria 4.1 & 4.2)

12. DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE

12. 1. RARITY

Taylor Memorial and Drinking Fountain has rarity value as a monument of glazed stoneware construction and unique design that serves as a combined drinking fountain and water troughs for horses, and cats and dogs. (Criteria 5.1 & 5.2)

Taylor Memorial and Drinking Fountain is the only known monumental structure in Western Australia to have constructed by the well-known English stoneware manufacturers, Doulton and Company. (Criterion 5.1)

12. 2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

12. 3 CONDITION

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough appears to be generally in a sound condition. It is noticeable, however, that some of the tiling has been replaced and that some of it is in a poor condition. The drinking fountain continues to operate but the horse trough is no longer in use.

12. 4 INTEGRITY

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is of moderate integrity. The drinking fountain component of the structure continues to be used, but the horse trough and subsidiary troughs do not. It is assumed that these uses could be re-established if the opportunity presented itself.

12. 5 AUTHENTICITY

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is of moderate/high authenticity. The authenticity is reduced by its relocation from its original site and also by the replacement of some of the original tiling and the drinking water outlet and tap.

13. SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

The documentary evidence has been compiled by Kristy Bizzaca, Historian. The physical evidence has been compiled by Alan Kelsall, Kelsall Binet Architects.

13.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is situated on a triangular shaped, grassed area formed by the intersection of Market and Phillimore Streets and Elder Place, Fremantle.

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough was constructed on the behalf of John Taylor in memory of his sons Ernest and Peter Taylor in 1905. John Taylor was a ship owner with the London firm Bethell and Company, which had a frequent steamship service from England to Australia. John Taylor visited Western Australia on a number of occasions establishing business interests in the State and became a well-known member of the Fremantle merchant class.¹

Three of John Taylor's ten children, John Foulkes, Ernest and Peter, also travelled to Western Australia.² It is to Ernest Baines Taylor and to Peter Southern Taylor that *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* was built in memorandum.

Ernest Baines Taylor arrived in Western Australia aboard one of his father's ships in November 1884. In 1885, Ernest became a purser on the *SS Natal*. After reported ill health, Ernest, aged 21 years, collapsed and died while visiting the home of W. D. Moore on 18 September 1885.³ Peter Southern Taylor arrived in Western Australia aboard his father's ship the *Elderslie* in 1887 and worked as an agent for his father. Peter, also aged 21 years, allegedly died on an expedition through Noonkambah after being speared by local Aboriginal people for walking on sacred ground. His death certificate records that Peter died on 19 March 1890 at Henry River Station in the Kimberley region, a station partly owned by his father John Taylor.⁴

John Taylor died in England circa 1904/1905. In his will, Taylor left instructions to executors of his local estate, Samuel Phillips and W. D. Moore, to sell his shares in the Fremantle Gas Company with the proceeds to go towards the commissioning and erection of a memorial to his two sons who

1 Biographical information from *Fremantle Gazette*, 13/10/1992; RWAHS Newsletter, Vol. 24, No. 5, June 1985, p. 4; *The Herald*, 19/9/1885.

2 Ibid.

3 *The Herald*, 19/9/1885; Information compiled by M. Bosworth & J. Ball in 1996 from City of Fremantle Municipal Inventory Database.

4 Information from *Fremantle Gazette*, 30/8/1988; *Fremantle Gazette*, 13/10/1992; Information compiled by M. Bosworth & J. Ball in 1996 from City of Fremantle Municipal Inventory Database; Biographical File: B/Taylor, City of Fremantle Local History Collection. **Note:** The deaths of John Taylor's sons was cause for much speculation and myth for a number of years. Respectively, reports claimed that the sons had died of thirst in the north of Western Australia; that the sons had been killed by Chinese seamen; and, that the sons had been trampled to death by a herd of camels. (Information from Taylor Memorial Fountain, File: 731.76, City of Fremantle Local History Collection.) Descendants of the Taylor family tell the story that John Foulkes Taylor had in fact nearly died from thirst during an expedition with John Forrest through the Kimberley region in 1883. (Information provided by Daphne Foulkes-Taylor from John Forrest's 1883 expedition diary in Biographical File: B/Taylor, City of Fremantle Local History Collection.)

had died young and far from their home in England.⁵ It is commonly believed that Taylor intended the memorial to take the form of a drinking fountain for all living creatures, providing facilities for humans, a horse trough, a bird bath, and a water tray for cats and dogs.⁶

In September 1904, it was reported that the Fremantle Council was happy to accept the gift of the drinking fountain as there were few in the town and a number of sites were considered for its location, including the grounds of the Church of England and the new Esplanade.⁷ In October 1904, it was reported that W. D. Moore had commissioned local architect J. H. Eales to design the structure, which was said to have an estimated cost of £175 to £200.⁸ However, the information in this newspaper article is believed to have been incorrect.

John Taylor appears to have arranged the construction of the structure in England, prior to his death circa 1904/1905. It is believed that Taylor ordered his structure from a late nineteenth century catalogue by the firm Doulton and Company Ltd, in which a drawing for a similar fountain appeared. The glazed stoneware 'Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough' was advertised at a cost of £110, with an option to supply two additional dog basins at £15. *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* was constructed in Lambeth in London.⁹

The boxes containing the pieces of the structure arrived in Fremantle from London in October 1905.¹⁰ Soon after its arrival, it was decided that *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* would be erected opposite the newly constructed railway station.¹¹

Fremantle local Jack Bradley recalled helping his father builder B. Bradley reassemble *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* in 1905, under the supervision of local architect James McNeece.¹² Problems soon arose on the project when it was realized that no plans or instructions had accompanied the six boxes of pieces, and it was eventually decided to erect only part of the structure; that is, the drinking fountain and horse trough.¹³ It is thought that most of the remaining pieces of what had been quite an

5 *The Mail*, 11/1/1905; RWAHS Newsletter, Vol. 24, No. 5, June 1985, p. 4.

6 *Fremantle Gazette*, 27/3/1980; see also *Daily News*, 4/6/1981 & *Fremantle Gazette*, 3/2/1978.

7 *The Mail*, 28/9/1904.

8 Ibid; *The Mail*, 15/10/1904.

9 Information compiled by M. Bosworth & J. Ball in 1996 from City of Fremantle Municipal Inventory Database; Information from the Register of the National Estate entry for *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough*.

10 Extract from Minutes of Meeting of Ovals, Parks & Reserves Committee, 22/9/1905 & 18/10/1905; see also *The Mail*, 11/1/1905; *The Evening Mail*, 24/10/1905.

11 *The Mail*, 11/1/1905; *The Evening Mail*, 24/10/1905.

12 *Fremantle Gazette*, 3/2/1978; *Daily News*, 4/6/1981. Other reports state that J. H. Eales supervised its construction, however this is believed to be incorrect. (*Fremantle Gazette*, 3/2/1978; information in Taylor Memorial Fountain, File: 731.76, City of Fremantle Local History Collection & Biographical File: B/Taylor, City of Fremantle Local History Collection.)

13 *Fremantle Gazette*, 3/2/1978; *Daily News*, 4/6/1981.

elaborate structure were discarded, although one of the two bird baths was still standing in the front garden of the Bradley home in 1981.¹⁴

By 1976, *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* had fallen into disrepair.¹⁵ Sketches and photographs in the 1970s and 1980s show that the structure had been partially boarded up and a timber cover and rails had been constructed to protect the horse trough and elevations.¹⁶

A survey of *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* was completed in 1978. The report identified foundation problems stating that the structure was sinking and appeared to lean on an angle. At the time, it was recommended that urgent works be undertaken.¹⁷

In June 1981, it was announced that the City of Fremantle received a grant of \$8, 500 for the restoration of *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* from the National Estate Grants Program.¹⁸ Marble masons were commissioned to number and dismantle the structure piece by piece during the restoration process.¹⁹ Local potter Joan Campbell reconstructed missing pieces of the structure, also reproducing the green glaze of the tiles to match the original.²⁰

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough was moved approximately two metres from its original site onto a new concrete foundation. (Works showed that the original timber and rubble foundation had been giving away under the weight of the terracotta horse trough.) Restoration of the structure was completed in August 1983.²¹

In February 2001, *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* continues to be used as a drinking fountain. The horse trough and the cat and dog troughs are not in use and the tap to the horse trough has been boarded up.

13. 2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Siting

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is situated on a triangular shaped, grassed area formed by the intersection of Market and Phillimore Streets and Elder Place, Fremantle. It stands slightly to the south of the pumping station and public lavatories building that occupy the same site. The

14 *Fremantle Gazette*, 3/2/1978; *Daily News*, 4/6/1981. A photograph of Jack Bradley and the bird bath appeared in the *Fremantle Gazette* on 3 February 1978. **Note:** The details of the part reconstruction of *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* and information about the missing sections/pieces of the original structure are an area of further research.

15 *West Australian*, 9/9/1976.

16 *Ibid*; *Fremantle Gazette*, 3/2/1978; see photographs and sketches in Taylor Memorial Fountain, File: 731.76, City of Fremantle Local History Collection.

17 1978 Survey in Taylor Memorial Fountain, File: 731.76, City of Fremantle Local History Collection.

18 *Daily News*, 4/6/1981.

19 *West Australian*, 10/9/1981. Problems dismantling the structure meant that some consideration was given to using a crane to lift the entire memorial to its new site and foundation. (*Western Mail*, 9/1/1982.)

20 *Fremantle Gazette*, 24/8/1983.

21 All information from *Fremantle Gazette*, 24/8/1983.

grassed area faces north across Phillimore Street to the Fremantle Railway Station with the Pioneer Park reserve to the west.

External form and style

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is a free-standing structure which is composed of an obelisk to which a rectangular shaped trough has been added. The shaft of the obelisk contains a fountain and the rectangular shaped horse trough is attached to the south side of the structure. The composition is tied together by scroll buttresses running along the top edge of the trough and abutting the sides of the central obelisk. The square shaped shaft of the obelisk is capped by a form of stepped pyramid. The drinking fountain, which is set into the north side of the shaft, projects slightly similar in form to a piscina. A small trough is set at ground level at each end of the trough, presumably to provide drinking water for dogs and other small animals.

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is an elaborately decorated structure which makes free use of a range of decorative elements borrowed from Classical, Baroque and possibly Egyptian and Art Nouveau styles of architecture. Interestingly the *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* displays some of the aesthetic characteristic of the Contarini tomb, Il Santo, Padua, 1544-48, designed by Sanmichele.²²

A dedication plaque is located above the arch spanning the recess that contains the drinking fountain and reads 'Erected by John Taylor of London in Memory of His Sons ERNEST & PETER who died in Western Australia'.

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough is faced completely by ceramic units with a mottled green/brown/grey glazed finish depicting, on the drinking fountain, sunflowers, shells and a pair of intertwined fish.

Appearance and condition of the building to date

Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough appears to be generally in a sound condition. However it is noticeable that some of the tiling is in a poor condition and there are some examples of inappropriate repairs having being carried out. The drinking fountain continues to operate but the horse trough is no longer in use.

13.3 COMPARATIVE INFORMATION

13.4 KEY REFERENCES

No key references.

13.5 FURTHER RESEARCH

The details of the design and construction of *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* at Doulton and Company in England should be verified with further research.

The details of the part reconstruction of *Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain and Horse Trough* in 1905 and information about the missing sections/pieces of the original structure are an area of further research.

²² Wittkower, R., *Studies in the Italian Baroque*, Thames and Hudson, England, 1982, p. 261.
Register of Heritage Places - Assessment Doc'n
Taylor Memorial Drinking Fountain & Horse Trough
28/08/2001

No information has been found about the history of the place from its erection in 1905 up until the 1970s, although it can be surmised that the horse trough fell into disuse upon the advent of the motor car. This is an area for further research.